



*Reforming the World Bank:
Will the New Gender Strategy Make a Difference?
A Study With China Case Examples*

By Elaine Zuckerman and Wu Qing

Content

1	Foreword
3	Executive Summary
6	Introduction
7	Background
11	How Effective Has the Gender Strategy Been to Date?
15	Progress Achieved in Meeting Stated Recommended Actions and Target Dates
34	Other Initiative Advancing the World Bank Gender Strategy
36	Conclusions and Recommendations
40	References & Authors
43	Annexes

Global Issue Papers, No. 9

Reforming the World Bank: Will the New Gender Strategy Make a Difference?

Published first by the Heinrich Böll Foundation, Washington Office, December 2003

© Heinrich Böll Foundation 2004

All rights reserved

The following paper does not necessarily represent the views of the Heinrich Böll Foundation

Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung, Hackesche Höfe, Rosenthaler Str. 40/41, D-10178 Berlin

Tel: ++49/30/285348; Fax: ++49/30/28534109

info@boell.de www.boell.de

Heinrich Böll Foundation; 1638 R Street, NW, Suite 120; Washington, DC 20009, U.S.A

Tel: ++1-202-462-7512; Fax: ++1-202-462-5230

info@boell.org www.boell.org

Foreword

By Liane Schalatek, Heinrich Böll Foundation, Washington Office

For many years, international research, including the work of international organizations like the World Bank and several United Nations agencies, has pointed out how promoting and encouraging equality between men and women improves the economic viability of poor countries, reduces poverty and encourages good governance. For the World Bank, the international development organization which claims poverty alleviation as its core mission, gender equality efforts need to be at the forefront of its programs and projects.

However, up to the most recent past, the World Bank's consideration of gender focused mainly on the Bank's social-reform programs, with a strong focus on health, child care and education as uniquely women's issues. Macro-economic policy focusing on economic development such as investment and public sector programs did not figure prominently in the Bank's gender-equality efforts, and the potential roles these programs, projects and policies could play in fostering wider social-economic opportunities for women were not evaluated.

The new World Bank Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, introduced in early 2002, is supposed to change the Bank's consideration of gender wholeheartedly, doing away with the notion that a World Bank investment decision, a bank infrastructure project or a World Bank loan program with policy conditionalities is seemingly gender-neutral. While many observers and analysts praised the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy after its publication as a well thought-out document, it is but an important first step forward. The real test of the worth of the Strategy is how well it is implemented Bank-wide and whether it succeeds in ensuring gender awareness and gender-equality by highlighting and ultimately removing gender-related barriers to poverty reduction and economic development.

The challenge for the World Bank is mainly, but not exclusively internal (some client countries do oppose gender mainstreaming mandates). While social scientists and economists at the Bank have produced plenty of gender disaggregated data and studies used widely by many women's advocate groups and development organizations, the Bank's main lending policies until now have not taken into account the work of its own social development branch. The Gender Mainstreaming Strategy promises to change this. But can it change the lending culture of the Bank and the mind-sets of its lending officers?

Just about a year after the World Bank's adaptation of its new Gender Mainstreaming Strategy, the Heinrich Böll Foundation North America asked the US NGO Gender Action to take a closer look at how the World Bank is faring in implementing it. What has been achieved to date? What are some of the successes and shortcomings of the Strategy put to work? What is the outlook for some of the medium- to long-term goals the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy outlines? Will the Strategy remove a "gender-neutral" bias displayed by the majority of the World Bank's economists and macroeconomic programs?

This study, written by Elaine Zuckerman and Wu Qing with the support of Aida Orgocka and Hilary Sims Feldstein, tries to provide some first answers to these

questions. Our thanks go to the authors for their excellent and diligent work. To our knowledge, this study is the first comprehensive look at the World Bank's Gender Mainstreaming Strategy and the Bank's efforts of putting it to work. We are certain it won't be the last analysis of this far-reaching World Bank policy, but hope that it can contribute to focus attention on the importance of gender awareness at the international financial institutions and in macroeconomic policy-making.

Executive Summary

There are several good reasons to promote **engendering – that is ensuring gender considerations are included in** – World Bank investments and other initiatives. The Bank's own research demonstrates compellingly that greater gender equality translates into greater economic growth and less poverty worldwide. Based on this argument, the Bank's new Gender Strategy, *“Integrating Gender in the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action”*, promotes the “business” and “poverty reduction” cases for engendering Bank investments and other initiatives. Another critical reason to engender Bank activities is the “human rights” case that women's rights and gender equality are fundamental for achieving full and equal human rights for all. Another key reason to engender Bank investments is because they are often conditioned on policy reforms fraught with harmful economic, environmental and social, including gender, consequences. Since attempts to close the Bank have shown no sign of succeeding, citizens groups must pressure for Bank reform to ensure all Bank investments and policies are socially and environmentally responsible. As part of a larger Bank reform effort, Gender Action is leading citizen advocacy around making multilateral investments like those of the World Bank promote gender equal development and rights.

This Study assesses the effectiveness and potential effectiveness of the Bank's Gender Strategy and recommends how to strengthen the Strategy. It describes how gender advocates inside the Bank have been trying to engender Bank investments and other initiatives over the last 25 years but their success has been limited. In September 2001, the World Bank Board of Executive Directors endorsed the Gender Strategy that this Study analyzes. The Study examines the Gender Strategy's strengths, weaknesses and implementation track record. This Study also analyzes the updated Bank Gender Operational Policy (OP) and an accompanying Bank Procedure (BP) to facilitate policy implementation that the Bank Board endorsed in 2003.

The Strategy merits review at this time because it:

- Systematizes and universalizes targets that, with few exceptions, were initiated prior to the Strategy.
- Contains many one year, as well as ongoing and longer term targets.

Much of the Study effort focused on assessing the extent to which the Bank is implementing and meeting its strategy targets. To determine implementation effectiveness, the Study interviewed Bank gender experts and a few non-gender experts, and examined a sample of Bank operations and analytical work in China (the Bank's largest borrower), as well as the Bank gender web pages.

Since creating its first “women in development” (WID) position in January 1977, the Bank has made significant progress in recognizing the necessity to reduce gender gaps. Subsequently, gender experts in the Bank have grown from 1 to some 115. In comparison, the number of Bank environmental experts grew from 1 in the early 1980s to an estimated 700-800 today. Environmental experts constitute roughly 7 percent of Bank staff and consultants compared to gender experts constituting less than 1 of Bank staff and consultants. While it is mandatory for Bank staff to analyze the environment impact of every operation, there are no mandates for gender.

Although environment issues are still not addressed satisfactorily, they receive much deeper attention than do gender gaps.

Moreover, a corps of 10-12 centralized gender unit staff plus regional coordinators at Bank headquarters has not expanded much since the mid-1980s. The majority of the 115 “gender experts” are country-based “gender focal points”, who add gender part time to other demanding responsibilities. Both headquarters gender staff and the focal points themselves complain that the focal points either lack understanding of gender issues or time to address them or both.

The small corps of full time Bank gender experts is of high quality. Many are sophisticated conveyers of the value derived from addressing gender issues in Bank activities. They do excellent work but their ranks need to expand significantly. Also, the Bank needs complementary incentives and accountability measures for non-gender staff to promote gender equality.

The Bank Gender Strategy centerpiece is the preparation of a Country Gender Assessment (CGA) for each client country. The Strategy is premised on the assumption that CGA priority gender issues will feed into Country Assistance Strategies (CASs) and other analytical and lending instruments. But this sequence might not unfold because a consistent track record demonstrates that Bank staff heed, albeit minimally, mandatory incentives such as the environmental safeguard policies and ignore non-mandated policies like that of gender. Staff responds to incentives that are clearly structured to get loans approved by the Board.

Our analysis of a representative sample of Bank analytical work, operations and the CAS in our China case study of the Bank’s largest client indicate that none of these Bank products seriously addresses gender gaps despite the timely availability of the China Country Gender Review that is supposed to feed into CASs and operations.

Judging Bank publicity alone, one has the impression that the Strategy is known around the Bank. The Gender Director indicated that the Bank had distributed some 8,000 copies of the new Strategy during 2002. Speeches by the Bank President and publicity around gender publications like *Engendering Development* underline the message that gender is important and should be mainstreamed into Bank operations. Contents of B-Span, the World Bank webcasting station on development issues, frequently mainstream gender issues.

But has the message reached Bank staff?

Interviews conducted for this Study suggest that perceptions in the Bank about Gender Strategy effectiveness divide roughly into two camps. On the one hand are the gender experts who work full time promoting gender integration into Bank activities. On the other hand are the vast majority of other staff, most of whom have neither heard of the Strategy nor looked at Bank gender web pages providing tools for engendering investments and other activities. Non-gender experts said they lack the time and incentives to look at the Gender Strategy or web pages. They feel overwhelmed by the proliferating number of Bank strategies numbering around 15 and an ever-growing list of Bank priorities. The World Bank’s mere \$600,000 Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming to facilitate Strategy implementation during the past fiscal year 2002 alone reflects the low priority gender commands among Bank priorities.

To ensure effective and consistent Gender Strategy implementation, the Strategy needs to be mandated. Although the revised operational policy and Bank procedure improve on the preceding policy, they replicate the unfunded non-mandated nature of the Gender Strategy. As a result, the centerpiece CGAs are likely to be of variable quality and will not be adequately reflected in investments. Mandates and incentives to ensure that Bank staff promotes gender equality and women's rights will contribute to reforming the Bank into a socially and environmentally responsible institution that lives up to its rhetoric to reduce poverty and gender inequalities worldwide.

*Reforming the World Bank:
Will the New Gender Strategy Make a Difference?
A Study With China Case Examples*

By Elaine Zuckerman and Wu Qing

1. Introduction

There are several good reasons to promote **engendering – that is ensuring gender considerations are included in** – World Bank investments and other initiatives. The Bank's own research demonstrates compellingly that greater gender equality translates into greater economic growth and less poverty worldwide (World Bank 2001a). Because of this argument, the Bank's new Gender Strategy, *“Integrating Gender in the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action”*, promotes the “business” and “poverty reduction” cases for engendering Bank investments and other initiatives. Another critical reason to engender Bank investments and other initiatives is the “human rights” case that women's rights and gender equality are fundamental for achieving full and equal human rights for all.

Yet another reason to engender Bank investments is because they are often conditioned on policy reforms fraught with harmful gender, social, economic and environmental consequences. For this reason, some Bank critics wish to end taxpayer-funded Bank investments.¹ But attempts to close the Bank have shown no sign of succeeding. Since the Bank is not closing its doors, citizens groups must pressure for Bank reform to achieve socially and environmentally optimal Bank investments and policy prescriptions. Gender Action was established to lead citizen advocacy around making multilateral investments like the World Bank's promote gender equal development and equal rights for men and women as part of a larger multilateral reform effort.

This paper describes how over the last 25 years, gender advocates in the Bank have been trying to engender Bank investments and other initiatives but their success has been limited. From time to time, they have produced new gender policies, strategies and plans to try to reach a wider Bank audience. In September 2001, the World Bank Board of Executive Directors endorsed the new Gender Strategy that this Study analyzes. The Study examines the Gender Strategy's strengths, weaknesses and implementation track record. In 2003, the Bank Board also endorsed an updated version of the Bank's gender Operational Policy (OP) and an accompanying Bank Procedure (BP) to facilitate policy implementation. This Study also analyzes these operational guidelines.

The Study takes an early look at the effectiveness and evaluates the potential effectiveness of the Bank's Gender Strategy. Although it might seem premature to assess a Strategy that was endorsed only in 2001, the Strategy merits review at this time because it:

¹ For example, the 50 Years is Enough Network, <http://www.50years.org>. Bruce Rich describes the genesis of such movements to shut the Bank down in Rich, 1994.

- Systematizes and universalizes targets that, with few exceptions, were initiated prior to the Strategy.
- Contains many one year, as well as ongoing and longer term target dates.

Much of this Study's effort focused on assessing the extent to which Bank is implementing and meeting its Strategy targets. To determine implementation effectiveness, the Study interviewed Bank gender experts and a few non-gender experts, examined a sample of Bank operations and analytical work in China (the Bank's largest borrower), and reviewed Bank gender web pages. The Study's methodology is summarized in Box 1 below:

The Study first provides a background section that explores:

- History – an historical retrospective on the evolution of gender in the Bank
- Extent of gender expertise in the Bank – an analysis of the growth and magnitude of the corps of gender experts in the Bank
- A brief summary of the main Strategy content.

Following this background content, the Study presents:

- Findings from interviews with Bank gender experts and non-gender staff
- Results of a gender analysis of operations in the case country – China
- Analysis of progress achieved in meeting Strategy targets through answering the question: “How Effective has the Gender Strategy Been to Date?”.

The Study ends with conclusions and recommendations.

2. Background

2.1 History

A review of Bank gender history reveals that the Bank has made significant progress in *recognizing* the necessity to reduce gender gaps since the concept “Women in Development” (WID) emerged in the early 1970s (Tinker 1990).

Following the 1975 Mexico City First World Conference on Women, the Bank created its first WID position. In January 1977, it hired a veteran WID pioneer and economist as WID Adviser.² Her challenge was, with meager resources, to sensitize predominantly male Bank staff and borrowers to understand how women affected and were impacted by Bank activities. Her strategies included preparing and sharing sector checklists of questions about women's roles for project managers. The questions asked how women could contribute to and benefit from projects and how projects impacted them. The Adviser presented these checklists at a series of sector division meetings. Early on, the Adviser learned to frame questions primarily in efficiency terms to reach economist-type Bank staff, although without neglecting

² Gloria Scott, who was a prominent WID promoter at the United Nations during the preceding decade, was the Bank's first WID Adviser during 1977-86.

equity. She developed training seminars on WID issues for Bank staff that Harvard University delivered. She joined missions to integrate women's issues into Bank projects and to channel women's voices into their design. During the first Adviser's term, the Bank created a policy requiring all projects to include a paragraph about the role of women. The first WID Adviser also presented the Bank WID agenda at interagency meetings. At the 1980 Copenhagen Second World Conference on Women, she presented a paper on behalf of the Bank called, "*Recognizing the Invisible Woman in Development*".

In 1986, the Bank appointed the second WID Adviser.³ She developed an ambitious work plan that she sold to senior management. It required several staff to implement it. Within a few years, the second Adviser became Chief of a WID Unit composed of about a dozen WID specialists. Unit financing came mainly from Bank resources, complemented by bilateral trust funds, especially from the Dutch and Nordic governments. To prioritize resources by sectors, the WID Unit targeted girls' education, health, agricultural extension, micro-credit, legal and labor issues. The Unit pioneered in-depth country gender assessments for Bangladesh, India, Kenya and Mexico. Unit staff joined Bank missions to integrate WID issues into projects. It reviewed every project Staff Appraisal Report (SAR) for WID analysis.⁴ The Unit generated groundbreaking research demonstrating very high returns to girls' education and women's good health. WID issues became mainstreamed into education and health operations. During the second Adviser's term, each of the then four Bank regions appointed a WID coordinator that promoted WID issues in all regional Bank investments, policies and strategies.

In 1994, a new WID Unit Chief took over.⁵ She replaced Staff Appraisal Report WID reviews with WID monitoring and evaluation of project implementation. Under her leadership, the Bank issued the first version of Operational Policy (OP) 4.20 that promoted reducing gender disparities and increasing women's participation in economic growth. She was part of the Bank team led by President James D. Wolfensohn that participated in the 1995 Beijing Fourth World Conference on Women.

At the Beijing conference, to exert external pressure on the Bank, civil society groups who were exasperated with slow Bank progress in integrating gender issues into Bank investments formed a gender advocacy campaign, Women's Eyes on the World Bank (WEWB). The surviving WEWB Latin America branch is a Gender Action partner that continues Bank gender advocacy work. Gender Action is building on and deepening WEWB efforts to make the multilaterals accountable for gender worldwide. Another WEWB partner organization, Women's EDGE, recently produced an advocacy guide for citizen's groups wanting to better understand where the Bank stands on gender and why gender advocacy is needed (Long 2003). The guide author argued convincingly in an interview that foundations supporting Bank reform around the environment and transparency would be wise to support advocacy groups pressuring the Bank to engender its activities (AWID 2003).

³ Barbara Herz, formerly the WID head at USAID and a Bank employee since 1980, filled the Bank WID Adviser and WID Unit Chief position from 1986-93.

⁴ Staff Appraisal Reports are the forerunners of today's Project Appraisal Documents (PADs) that Bank staff prepare and the Board of Directors must approve for projects to be implemented.

⁵ Min Chau headed the WID Unit from 1994-97.

Around the time of the Beijing conference, the Bank replaced the WID approach with a Gender and Development (GAD) approach. Following the Beijing Conference and the 1995 Bank reorganization into a matrix system that marries six regions with five major networks, the WID unit was reincarnated as the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network Gender and Development Unit (PRMGE).⁶ It was strategic to locate the gender unit inside the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) Network to emphasize the importance of gender roles in poverty reduction and convince influential Bank economists that gender matters for economic growth. PRMGE is informally called the “*gender anchor*”. Gender’s stature in the Bank was also enhanced by the creation of a Gender and Development Board in 1997 composed of the regional gender coordinators, network and anchor staff. The Bank appointed a new Gender Board Chair and PRMGE Director.⁷ Under the new Director, the anchor has generated several key products aimed to push the Bank gender agenda forward:

- **“Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice”** (World Bank 2001a). This is the first Bank Policy Research Report (PRR) dedicated to gender issues.⁸ It was co-written with the Bank’s research complex. The gender PRR presents compelling correlations worldwide between greater gender equality on the one hand, and greater growth and less poverty on the other. It is a seminal work that synthesizes almost three previous decades of research on WID and gender issues.
- A revised version of Operational Policy 4.20, “Gender and Development” and new Bank Procedure 4.20 with the same title (World Bank 2003b; World Bank 2003c). This Study analyzes both of these companion products.
- **“Integrating Gender into the World Bank’s Work: A Strategy for Action”**, the subject of this Study (World Bank 2002a).⁹ The Strategy builds on “Engendering Development” and the evolution of WID and gender integration into international development initiatives. On September 18, 2001, the World Bank Board of Executive Directors endorsed this new Gender Strategy.

⁶ The Bank’s six regions are: Africa (AFR); East Asia and Pacific (EAP); Eastern Europe and Central Asia (ECA); Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC); Middle East and North Africa (MENA); and South Asia (SAR).

The Bank’s five major thematic networks are: Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD); Financial Sector Network (FSN); Human Development Network (HDN); Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM); and Private Sector and Infrastructure (PSI).

In addition, the Bank has a few supporting networks and major complexes, for example, the Operations Evaluation Department (OED) and the World Bank Institute (WBI).

⁷ Karen Mason, formerly of the University of Hawaii, has chaired the Gender and Development Board and headed the gender anchor since 1999.

⁸ The Policy Research Report is the prestigious annual flagship Bank research product.

⁹ In the remainder of this report, this strategy is referred to as the “*Gender Strategy*” or simply as the “*Strategy*”.

2.2 Extent of Gender Expertise in the Bank

From the 1977 appointment of the first Bank WID Adviser, gender expert ranks in the Bank have grown from a single person to some 115.¹⁰ In comparison, the number of Bank environmental experts grew from just one in the early 1980s to an estimated 700-800 today. Using a conservative estimate of the total number of Bank staff and consultants of around 15,000, environmental experts constitute roughly 7 percent of Bank staff and consultants. In comparison, the 115 gender experts constitute less than one percent (roughly 0.77 percent) of Bank staff and consultants.

Despite the impressive growth of Bank environmental experts, civil society groups still complain that the Bank inadequately implements its environmental policies. This suggests that numerous experts alone are insufficient but are one of several necessary factors for achieving policy effectiveness. Others are strong managerial endorsement of the primacy of environment or social, including gender, objectives, sensitized and committed staff, strong advocacy policies, widespread and deep dissemination of these policies among staff and incentives to implement them. The Bank must demonstrate that environment and social, including gender, objectives take precedence over pushing loans and that the quality of investments is more important than the quantity (Rich 2002).

Of the some 115 Bank gender experts, the core of only 10-12 central gender unit staff has not expanded since the mid-1980s. Sadly, the majority of the 115 are country-based “gender focal points”, who add gender to their other busy responsibilities. They can only devote part time to gender. Both Bank gender coordinators and the focal points themselves complain that the focal points either lack understanding of gender issues or time to address them or both.

The current institutional placement of gender experts in the Bank appears to be well conceived but is inadequate. The placement is well adapted to the Bank regions. However, it does not respond adequately to the Bank networks. For example, the Financial Sector (FSN) and Private Sector and Infrastructure (PSI) networks are virtually devoid of gender experts. In some regions, ESSD or PREM lack gender expertise. The Human Development Network (HD) intrinsically addresses gender because education and health mainstream gender better than other sectors do. More details about the institutional placement and quality of Bank gender experts are provided in the section below, “Adequate Staff Resources Available”, that analyzes Strategy targets.

The small corps of full-time Bank gender experts, excluding many of the part-time gender focal points, tends to be of high quality. Many are sophisticated conveyers of the added value of addressing gender in Bank activities. They do excellent work but their ranks need to expand significantly. Also, the Bank needs complementary incentives and accountability measures for staff to promote gender equality and women’s rights.

¹⁰ The gender anchor provided the number of around 115 current Bank gender experts on staff.

2.3 Summary Strategy Content

The Strategy centerpiece is the preparation of a Country Gender Assessment (CGA) for each Bank client country that would feed into Country Assistance Strategies (CASs) and operations that ensue from CASs.

The Strategy contains three processes:

- “Prepare, for each country in which the Bank has an active lending program, a periodic, Country Gender Assessment analyzing the gender dimensions of development across sectors and identifying the gender-responsive actions that are important for poverty reduction, economic growth, human well-being and development effectiveness, and use it to inform the Bank’s country assistance program;
- Develop and implement, as part of the country assistance program, priority policy and operational interventions that respond to the CGA; and
- Monitor the implementation and results of these policy and operational interventions” (World Bank 2002a).

The Strategy recognizes that this process needs to be country-specific and country-led, with the Bank playing a supportive but pro-active role.

The Strategy itself is process oriented. It suggests that Bank managers and staff embrace new processes. The Strategy is premised on the assumption that with the preparation of CGAs, relevant analytical and lending instruments will address gender issues. But this sequence might not play out because the assumption ignores a consistent record showing that Bank staff responds to mandatory incentives, above all to getting loans approved that minimally meet required Safeguard Policies.¹¹ The Bank Safeguard Policies do not include the non-mandated gender policies.

3. How Effective has the Gender Strategy Been to Date?

To examine Gender Strategy effectiveness, this section presents the results of interviews with Bank staff, analyses of Bank operations and impressions from World Bank learning events.

Judging by Bank publicity alone, one has the impression that the Strategy is known around the Bank. The Gender Director indicated that the Bank had distributed some 8,000 copies of the new Strategy during 2002. Speeches by the Bank President and publicity around gender publications like *“Engendering Development”* provide the impression that the message that gender is important and should be mainstreamed into Bank operations is made repeated frequently and heard. Contents on B-Span, the World Bank webcasting station on development issues, frequently mainstream gender issues.

¹¹ The Bank’s 10 mandated Safeguard Policies address environment, resettlement and indigenous policy issues. The Bank created the mandatory policies in response to incessant external pressure (Rich 1994, 2002).

Despite this massive publicity, has the message reached Bank staff?

3.1. Interviews

Interviews for this Study suggest that perceptions in the Bank about Gender Strategy effectiveness divide roughly into two camps. On the one hand is the small corps of gender experts who work full time promoting gender integration into Bank activities. They are familiar with and keen advocates of the Gender Strategy; many of them contributed to creating the Strategy. Also some Bank non-gender experts who are gender advocates are in this camp. Gender anchor staff and most regional gender coordinators interviewed feel their multiple initiatives to sensitize Bank staff and clients to gender have been fairly effective. These initiatives are discussed further in this Study.

Despite the strength of the gender experts, their messages appear to reach too few non-gender experts. This conclusion is based on a spot check about the awareness of gender and the Strategy conducted among non-gender experts who are in the other camp.

Interviews with a handful of non-gender expert Bank staff indicate that probably very few non-gender experts have a gender mindset. This conclusion is indicative of spot checks, not a scientific survey because it was based on interviewing only seven Bank non-gender experts (Annex 1). The non-gender experts interviewed were not selected based on whether they might or might not be gender aware. They were selected because they were willing to be interviewed and had experience working on Bank operations. Of the seven non-gender experts asked if they were aware of the Strategy, all but one responded that they had never heard of the Strategy. None of the non-gender experts interviewed had read the Strategy. Asked if they ever looked at any Bank web pages presenting gender content, gender analysis tools, sex-disaggregated data, analytical publications and operational best practices about gender and development, two of the non-gender experts had opened a Bank gender website but only once. When asked if they ever considered the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming, two answered affirmatively. When asked if they knew who their regional gender coordinator is, only one could name the coordinator. Most were unaware that their regions had gender coordinators. When asked if they had ever attended any gender training, their answers were uniformly negative.

While it would not be scientific to extrapolate alone from such a small number of non-gender experts, other data corroborate that Bank non-gender experts are oblivious overall or are unmotivated to address gender issues in their work. For example, discussions over years by the lead author with Bank staff working across sectors around the world corroborate this conclusion. Moreover, **several regional gender coordinators estimated that probably less than five percent of their regions' economists had glanced at the Strategy.** Also, many Bank economists that the lead author interviewed for previous Bank gender analyses expressed no interest in or time for gender issues (World Bank 2002b; Zuckerman 2000b).

All the non-gender experts said they lacked the time and incentives to look at the Gender Strategy or gender mainstreaming websites. They all felt overwhelmed by the

proliferating number of Bank strategies. The Bank website lists 14 thematic and sector strategies.¹² The non-gender experts' answers underline that they are driven by the Bank lending culture and mandates, not by unfunded non-mandated strategies and policies such as those relating to gender.

3.2 Operations

Besides conducting interviews, a key approach of this Study was analyzing a sample of Bank operations, since the real test of the Strategy's implementation is the extent to which Bank investments address gender issues. As a case study, we analyzed Bank operations in one Bank client country, China. It made sense to analyze the Bank's China portfolio for several reasons: first, China is by far the largest Bank borrower; second, both Study co-authors are China gender experts; and third, the Bank completed the China Country Gender Review (CGR) in 2000, before the Gender Strategy was launched, providing Bank staff working on China with a deep analysis of major gender gaps in China (World Bank 2002b).¹³

China might not seem to be a representative Bank borrower country in at least one way. Since it recently graduated from obtaining a blend of IDA concessional-IBRD market interest rates to pure IBRD eligibility (i.e. it no longer qualifies for the lowest rate, long-term loans the Bank provides for its poorest borrowing countries), it decided to minimize Bank loans for social sector projects.¹⁴ Thus the China portfolio today is infrastructure weighted. Gender analyses of Bank operations across countries and sectors reveal that gender tends to be better addressed in traditional "women's" sectors – specifically the social sectors, particularly education and health. In contrast, infrastructure, structural adjustment and other large investments tend to neglect gender. However, the China projects reviewed for this analysis are representative of Bank projects generally. First, they include some social sector projects, especially those approved before 2000. Second, the infrastructure projects are in sectors such as water and sanitation, transport, the environment and rural development where men and women play distinct gender roles and often have distinct needs.

This Study's gender analysis of Bank projects in China depended on two initiatives: First, an analysis of 6 of 24 projects the Bank approved for China during 2000-2002. The sample selected is representative of the sectors the Bank supports in China. This analysis found that only one project, a water conservation project, recognized women's important sector role. However, this and all the other five

¹² The Bank website states that strategies "provide a vision to guide the Bank's future work in a given sector". Strategies are revised every three years, through stakeholder consultations. The following thematic and sector strategies have been published on the World Bank website: Anti-corruption; Education; Environment; Gender; Governance & Public Sector Reform; Health, Nutrition and Population; HIV/AIDS Strategy for Africa; Mining (Regional Strategies); Private Sector; Rural Development Strategy (draft); Telecommunications and Informatics; Urban & Local Government; Urban Transport (consultation); Water Resources Managment. See www.worldbank.org.

¹³ This Study's lead author also wrote the China Country Gender Review (World Bank 2002b).

¹⁴ IDA is the Bank lending arm that provides low-interest loans to lower-income developing countries. IBRD is the Bank lending arm that lends at market interest rates to middle income developing countries.

projects analyzed failed to consider the projects' gender differentiated needs and impacts. Further are presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Summary Gender Analysis of World Bank Projects in China, 2000 - 2002¹⁵

<u>Project</u>	<u>Year App.</u>	<u>Gender Analysis</u>
Tuberculosis Control Project	2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focuses on the poor but makes no effort to disaggregate data by gender. • Does not address female-specific vulnerability and risks. • Does not state how women will benefit from project outcomes. • Mentions a women's NGO might be a project stakeholder without explaining why or how it would be involved.
National Railway Project	2002	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides no gender analysis of project impacts especially important in land appropriation from owners. • Made no effort to interview women and men impacted by the project.
Third Inland Waterways Project	2001	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains no gender analysis of social impacts including resettlement and land lost by inundation although the project aims to indirectly reduce poverty and improve lives of families and especially children. • States local people affected were consulted, but with no separate consultations for women and men nor any gender issue focus.
Urumqi Urban Transport Improvement Project	2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Neglects to consider gendered needs and impacts in analyses of present and proposed improved transport system. • Discusses resettlement strategies without indicating male and female needs and impacts.
Second Beijing Environment Project	2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contains no discussion of gender disaggregated impacts of project to improve wastewater, air quality and other environmental systems. • Neglected to consult men and women separately or explore their differentiated needs during the public hearings.
Water Conservation Project	2000	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recognizes women's important role in farm irrigation management. • Neglects the different effects on males and females in a project survey of impacted communities that presented the view of "farmers" generically.

Second, this Study used the results of the Bank China Country Gender Review (CGR) gender analysis of operations approved during 1997-2000 (World Bank 2002b). The China CGR analysis included a representative sample of 23 out of 97 projects under implementation across sectors during 2000. It also analyzed all 11 pieces of Bank Economic and Sector Work (ESW is a Bank term for analytical research) on China completed since 1997. A table summarizing this gender analysis can be found in the China CGR that concludes,

"Overall, the Bank portfolio of ESW and projects in China only considers gender to a limited extent..... Most of the other Bank analyses and projects reviewed miss opportunities to consider the gender implications of important issues like poverty reduction, resettlement and labor market shifts such as migration and state-owned-enterprise (SOE) restructuring. Addressing the gender-differentiated effects of these Bank-supported interventions would contribute to reducing poverty."

A remarkable CGR finding was that the many detailed Bank rural poverty analyses neither acknowledged the well documented feminization of poverty and agriculture in China nor China's record of having the world's highest female suicide rate and one of the most rapidly proliferating patterns of trafficking in women and girls. Both China's

¹⁵ Aida Orgocka, a Gender Action gender and development expert, undertook this analysis.

female suicide and trafficking victims are concentrated heavily among poor young rural females (World Bank 2002b).

The analyses in Table 1 and in the China CGR suggest that progress in engendering Bank projects in China has not occurred since the CGR was made available since 2000. Moreover, this Study's assessment below of the extent to which China's CAS incorporates CGR findings demonstrates that the China CAS neglected incorporating CGR findings and recommendations although this flow of information constitutes the heart of the Strategy process.

4. Progress Achieved in Meeting Stated Recommended Actions and Target Dates

This section analyzes the track record of virtually all, about 20, Gender Strategy priority targets.

In the text and in tables, the Strategy presents a series of actions with target dates to achieve gender mainstreaming. An implementation timetable contains three columns: strategy elements, recommended actions, and target dates (World Bank 2002a Table 2.2). Target dates are roughly divided into one year, ongoing and longer term. Some target dates could be switched from one timeframe to another but this is not a significant issue. More important issues are the extent to which these targets are implementable and likely to have a meaningful impact in moving the gender and Bank reform agenda forward, and what is missing in these targets in order for the Strategy to achieve its goals. This section of the Study analyzes the implementation status of most proposed Strategy actions against their target dates.

Gender anchor staff underlined that few of the recommended actions are new Bank activities. Virtually all of them were initiated prior to the Strategy, some of them years ago (see the History section above). However, the Strategy systematizes and universalizes these actions across countries.

Of the many Strategy targets, Country Gender Assessments (CGAs) stand out as the most central element. But the Strategy overall and its recommended CGA in particular need to be mandated to move beyond only inconsistent and occasional follow up. Only when gender and other Bank poverty-reducing social objectives are mandated will effective implementation become possible.

4.1 Year One Strategy Targets

4.1.1 Adequate Staff Resources Available

As the "Extent of Gender Expertise in the Bank" section above reported, gender experts compose less than one percent of Bank staff and consultants. The majority of these "experts" are actually country-based gender focal points who often lack gender expertise and devote only part time, sometimes only 10-15 percent of their time, to

integrating gender into Bank products. The ranks of genuine gender experts and the gender expertise of focal points needs to be augmented.

The current institutional placement of the small ranks of gender experts in the Bank's headquarters was organized prior to the articulation of the Strategy. It appears to be well conceived and adapted to the Bank's matrix organization that marries six regions with four major networks. World Bank headquarters in Washington DC house the central gender anchor and Gender Board strategically located in the Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network (PREM). The anchor, with about a dozen gender experts, organizes gender research, training and promotional work in the Bank. Gender experts in the anchor have complementary disciplinary backgrounds including legal, anthropological, sociological and economic expertise. But there are too few gender anchor experts.

Some networks, particularly the Financial Sector Network (FSN) and Private Sector and Infrastructure (PSI), have very weak gender capacity. Parts of Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD) and Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) have gender expertise but there are gaps. The Human Development's (HD) education and health sectors tend to integrate gender issues more than do other sectors. This Study recommends that the Bank place gender experts strategically in all networks in order to meet the Strategy goal of mainstreaming gender into all Bank activities.

Although each region has at least one regional gender coordinator and most regions have more than one gender expert at headquarters, they lament the inadequate number of gender experts on their regional staffs.¹⁶ The vast majority of actual Bank gender experts are located at headquarters. The headquarters-based Gender and Development Board brings together gender experts from the Bank regions, networks and anchor to approve new gender policies, strategies and directions.

The regional coordinator system is complemented by Bank Country Office gender focal points. Most gender focal points are civil society officers or other social sector experts who add gender to their other responsibilities. Their quality is very uneven – some are excellent and some are weak, but Bank staff characterizes them as mostly weak. Many are junior consultants who lack authority. The Africa Region (AFR) has 30 gender focal points that Bank staff describes as mostly weak. Middle East and North Africa (MENA), the region where women tend to possess the least rights and opportunities, has only one focal point in Egypt.¹⁷ Many focal points, even those with gender expertise, cannot allocate more than 10-15 percent of their time to gender issues. A potentially strong gender focal point complained that only 10 percent of her time is available for gender.¹⁸ Only a tiny minority of Country Offices employ dedicated gender experts. This Study recommends that country gender focal points be dedicated experts with sufficient seniority and time to be taken seriously. A deeper analysis of regional gender patterns is presented here:

Africa (AFR) – AFR's gender coordinator is located in the joint PREM-ESSD Poverty Reduction and Social Policy unit. The current coordinator has worked in the

¹⁶ South Asia has lacked a regional gender coordinator for a couple of years, a position that should be filled soon.

¹⁷ See Annex 5 for comparative regional gender indicators.

¹⁸ In a discussion with the lead author during the spring of 2003.

region for many years, providing desirable continuity. Unfortunately, AFR's gender staff has shrunk over the last few years. The regional gender coordinator lamented the inadequacy of staff and financial resources available to fully implement the Strategy. The region has three gender experts addressing about 40 countries. The gender coordinator felt the country-based gender focal point system is not working very well in AFR. Although some gender focal points do a fine job, others are unaware of their gender responsibilities. The ESSD team in this region is likely to benefit by the recent arrival of the dynamic former LAC gender unit head. Although she is not joining the regional gender team, she is likely to automatically mainstream gender into all her work. Moreover, the regional Chief Economist is sympathetic to gender issues.

East Asia and Pacific (EAP) – EAP's regional gender coordinator at headquarters since 1998 moved to the Thailand Country Office in 2002. She is affiliated with ESSD. Meanwhile, EAP headquarters welcomed a new half-time regional gender coordinator belonging to HD and PREM. Thus EAP uniquely has one and a half regional gender coordinators. The two coordinators have complementary expertise, one being a more operational social scientist and the other is a more analytical economist. Both are savvy at navigating the Bank bureaucracy. Several EAP Country Offices have dedicated gender coordinators rather than part-time focal points. EAP's regional Vice President deserves credit for pro-actively promoting gender mainstreaming. He has proposed convening a videoconference with Country Office gender coordinators and suggested that country directors and lead economists participate. This high level attention to gender should send a strong message about the importance of gender in EAP. However, the EAP regional Chief Economist and country economists expressed no interest in gender issues when the lead author interviewed them in 2000 for a macroeconomic policy and gender analysis (Zuckerman 2000b).

Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) – LAC's gender coordinator reports to the Chief Economist/PREM Director, resulting in a powerful collaboration. Prior to the 1995 Beijing conference, LAC had virtually no gender experts, lagging behind the other regions. Since then, it has surpassed other regions by developing a full headquarters unit employing about a dozen gender experts who have generated high quality work. It did this by creatively raising trust funds to finance the unit. Notable unit achievements include valuable research on a range of gender topics and gender mainstreaming of various operations by demonstrating that gender can enhance project efficiency (Annex 4). LAC developed a best practice of generating demand for its gender experts to contribute to operations.

Middle East and North Africa (MENA) – MENA's gender coordinator, like LAC's, reports to the Chief Economist/PREM Director. The MENA Chief Economist has also been a gender advocate. But there are only two MENA headquarters staff working on gender in a region facing the most enormous gender gaps among regions (Annex 5). Moreover, MENA has only one Country Office gender focal point, in Egypt. MENA has the lowest female labor participation rate of all regions with only 27% of women working, and only one half of women over 15 years of age in the region are literate. The gender coordinator pointed out that despite regional gender stereotypes, more males than females attend Bank regional gender meetings.

Europe and Central Asia (ECA) – ECA’s gender coordinator has faced an uphill battle to convince colleagues that there are significant gender gaps in a region where gender indicators are the most equal of all regions (Annex 5). Women’s social indicators are excellent because they are a legacy of the egalitarian-oriented socialist era. However, as a result of market liberalization and other structural reforms, serious gender gaps have emerged such as renewed discrimination in hiring women, sexual harassment in the workplace, domestic violence, trafficking in women and the disproportionate effects of the collapse of the pension system on the high number of regional widows. Although the ECA gender coordinator is located in PREM, apparently the coordinator and Chief Economist do not collaborate much.

South Asia Region (SAR) – SAR places the gender coordinator in ESSD but for a long time the SAR coordinator role has been vacant. For a while, a consultant was Acting Regional Gender Coordinator via telecommuting five days per month. SAR expects to appoint a full-time coordinator at headquarters in 2003. Presence at the Bank’s headquarters in Washington is important for meetings and other interaction with the DC-based Gender Board, anchor etc. SAR has four focal points with strong gender expertise but they lack time to concentrate on gender issues. SAR might soon add a fifth gender focal point.

4.1.2 Incentive Funding

The World Bank Management Committee provided a \$600,000 one-year Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming to facilitate Strategy implementation during the past fiscal year 2002. The grant was funded by the Bank’s Global Public Goods (GPG) resources. Each of the Bank’s six regions received \$100,000 from the Incentive Fund. All regions spent the full amount except for SAR. This limited one-year funding for Strategy implementation leaves the regions with few or no resources to implement the Strategy except for any funds they can obtain from Country Directors who have many competing claims on their funds. The very modest one-year Incentive Funding reflects the low priority gender commands among Bank priorities.

4.1.3 New Operational Policy and Bank Procedures Statements on Gender and Development

All Bank investments must conform to a set of Operational Policies (OPs) and Bank Procedures (BPs) contained in the Bank Operational Manual issued to each staff member. Their purposes in the Bank’s own language are as follows: “Operational Policies (OPs) are short, focused statements that follow from the Bank’s Articles of Agreement, the general conditions and policies approved by the Board of Executive Directors. They establish the parameters for the conduct of operations, describe the circumstances in which exceptions to policy are admissible, and spell out who authorizes exceptions. Bank Procedures (BPs) explain how Bank staff carry out the

OPs by describing the procedures and documentation required to ensure Bankwide consistency and quality.”¹⁹

In March 2003, the Bank Board of Directors approved the new “Gender and Development” Operational Policy (OP 4.20) and companion Bank Procedure (BP 4.20) (World Bank Operational Manual 2003b and 2003c). Both explicitly draw on the Gender Strategy. OP 4.20 revises the preceding 1999 version that in turn replaced the original OP 4.20 first approved in 1994.²⁰ BP 4.20 is entirely new. The full texts of the OP 4.20²¹ and BP 4.20²² can be accessed on the Bank website.

The latest OP is more specific than the 1999 version. The latest version states that the Bank will prepare a Country Gender Assessment (CGA) for each borrower country. In turn the CGA will inform policy dialogue with the country and feed into the Bank’s Country Assistance Strategy (CAS) and projects.

The new BP states that the Country Director oversees preparation of the CGA that can be based on Bank gender analysis and consultations or those undertaken by other organizations. Specifically, a footnote states that, “The gender assessment may be a stand-alone assessment or may be carried out as part of other Bank economic and sector work, such as poverty assessments, country economic memoranda, public expenditure reviews, development policy reviews, poverty and social impact assessments, or institutional analyses. Alternatively, it may be an assessment that has been carried out by the country or an organization other than the Bank, if the Bank finds the assessment to be satisfactory.” A regional gender coordinator underlined that with many competing resources, it will be tempting to use non-CGA instruments without guaranteeing their quality given that most of the cited Bank alternatives have historically neglected gender issues.

The BP also lists typical gender assessment content such as distinct male-female socioeconomic roles, gender disparities in access, control and use of assets and resources, human development indicators, participation in decision-making and causes for gender discrimination or inequalities. In addition, the new BP assigns Bank managers and staff responsibilities for translating gender assessment results into the CAS and projects and for internal reporting on implementing this policy. The revised OP and BP definitely improve on the preceding policy but they perpetuate an unfunded unmandated Gender Strategy. Implications include that CGAs are likely to be of variable quality and will not be adequately reflected in investments.

4.1.4 Incorporating Gender Dimensions into Other Operational Policies

Including Operational Policy OP 4.20, the Bank has some 30 operational policies listed on its website.²³ According to gender anchor staff, they have engendered the

¹⁹ <http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/EXTABOUTUS/0,,contentMDK:20040574~menuPK:34574~pagePK:34542~piPK:36600~theSitePK:29708,00.html>.

²⁰ The revised OP 4.20 also replaces the “Operational Memorandum on Gender and Development” (OMGD) that the Bank issued in late 2001 presenting interim guidelines to staff for strengthening implementation of the 1999 OP 4.20 and promoting the recently endorsed Gender Strategy.

²¹ <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual.nsf/OPow?OpenView>.

²² <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual.nsf/BProw?OpenView>.

²³ <http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual.nsf/>.

Social Development OP and plan to engender the Poverty OP. This Study could find no operational policies with these or similar names among the 30 included on the Bank website. The gender anchor stated it intends to engender other operational policies with time. The anchor should consider accelerating engendering the many OPs that are very influential in project design such as the 10 mandatory safeguard policies included among the OPs. Many civil society have complained that the Bank's recent streamlining of OPs has diluted their contents and impacts (Rich 2002).

4.1.5 Mainstreaming Gender into Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs), Country Assistance Strategies (CASs), Quality Assurance Group (QAG) Assessments

World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) produce Joint Staff Assessments (JSAs) of Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) that accompany PRSPs presented to the institutions' Boards of Directors. The Bank and the IMF introduced PRSPs as a prerequisite for the poorest countries participating in the Highly Indebted Poor Country (HIPC) initiative to have their Bank and Fund debts reduced. Subsequently, the Bank and the Fund introduced PRSPs in non-HIPC low-income developing and transition countries too.

JSAs assess for the Boards whether or not PRSPs provide a sound basis for concessional assistance from the Bank and the Fund. They analyze how rigorously PRSPs address poverty, environmental and other issues. To determine the extent to which JSA assessments address gender needs, this study analyzed the JSA Guidelines and another Gender Action report analyzed all 2002 JSAs for gender (Zuckerman & Garrett 2003). This Study concluded that JSA Guidelines need to more rigorously flag gender issues. Zuckerman and Garrett concluded that JSA gender analyses are of highly variable quality and tend to be superficial. Since each country JSA is appropriately undertaken by staff members who are country experts, it is not surprising that there is no consistency in JSA content. But they should consistently include a gender analysis and it should be of high quality. The analysis of 2002 JSAs revealed that for the 13 PRSPs produced in 2002, two JSAs were removed from the Bank website shortly after Gender Action's analyst noted they lacked gender analysis. Of the 11 JSAs that then remained on the Bank website, some 7 or two thirds superficially analyzed PRSPs for gender and two neglected gender issues altogether.²⁴ Curiously enough, the JSAs for some of the better engendered PRSPs like those of Malawi and Rwanda contained negligible information about gender issues (Zuckerman & Garrett 2003).

Since the advent of Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs), CASs have become country business plans defining the composition of Bank assistance in support of the "country-owned" PRSP. Previous CASs formulated the framework for Bank investments based on a Bank analysis of development needs in consultation with the

²⁴ Denise Colbert, a Gender Action associate, analyzed all 2002 JSAs for gender. Her analysis is incorporated into Zuckerman and Garrett 2003 available at www.genderaction.org.

country. Now the “country owned” PRSP is supposed to identify these needs.²⁵ Bank country department staff members prepare CASs for their countries every three years.

Operational Policy 4.20, “Gender and Development”, discussed above, explicitly recommends that CASs integrate gender analysis (World Bank 2003b). Moreover, the Gender Strategy establishes a process whereby Country Gender Assessments (CGAs), the Gender Strategy centerpiece, will feed into CASs.

Gender anchor reviews of CASs show they are becoming increasingly attentive to gender issues. From fiscal year 1998-99 to fiscal year 1999-2000 the proportion of CASs rated satisfactory or very satisfactory in addressing gender issues increased from 53 percent to 61 percent and the proportion rated unsatisfactory or marginally satisfactory declined from 47 percent to 39 percent (World Bank 2003d). Indeed, CASs today are mainstreaming gender better than previously.

However, Gender Action found that CASs are far from universally engendered. Here are a few regional examples. MENA gender staff recently analyzed seven CASs. They found that three address gender disparities (Algeria, Egypt and Yemen), two include a gender box (Morocco and Tunisia), and two do not address gender at all (Jordan and Lebanon). It is surprising that the Morocco CAS only includes a box on gender since Moroccan women’s civil society groups prepared an excellent in-depth country gender assessment in 1999 with Bank support (Royaume 1999). But the Moroccan CGA did not feed into the CAS. MENA staff members expect the Iran CAS for the fiscal year 2004 to be engendered.

LAC’s gender staff reported that prior to the Strategy arrival they focused less on engendering CASs than on producing Country Gender Assessments as a direct entry point to integrating gender into projects. They adopted this approach to achieve greater impact with limited resources. With the arrival of a new LAC gender coordinator, the region is likely to renew emphasis on engendering CASs.

EAP’s gender staff reported that the Philippines and Thailand CASs include gender inputs and the Cambodia and Laos CGAs are expected to feed into these countries’ CASs.

But the latest Bank CAS for China, EAP’s and the entire Bank’s largest client, seriously neglects gender issues. This Study featuring China as its case country assesses the extent to which the China CAS integrates gender issues. The latest China CAS was published in 2003. The Bank’s first China Country Gender Review (CGR), written and available to Bank staff since 2000, was published in Chinese and English in 2002 virtually verbatim with a new foreword (World Bank 2002b). The China CGR provides an in-depth analysis of a host of gender issues including the legal and regulatory framework, labor market, poverty, and other issues that are very relevant to the new CAS. China CGR contents should have fed into the CAS. The CAS missed the opportunity to integrate the China CGR analysis and recommendations. The text of the China CAS only mentions gender once. However, the CAS includes a short annex summarizing the CGR that is clearly an add-on. Since this summary of gender recommendations for China’s Bank portfolio is the 18th out of 20 annexes, few are

²⁵ Countries do not feel that Bank and IMF mandated PRSPs elaborating structural adjustment content and requiring Bank and IMF Board approval can be genuinely country-owned. For more information on country ownership of PRSPs, see Zuckerman 2002a and Zuckerman and Garrett 2003.

likely to read and use it. The gender annex is neither referenced nor integrated into the text of the CAS.

Even if CASs integrate gender issues satisfactorily, addressing these issues in Bank investments remains a major challenge. Most often gender issues in investments center around girls' education, maternal mortality and reproductive health. According to the Bank gender anchor's own assessment, "While almost 23 percent and 21 percent of the CASs proposed gender-specific actions in the education and health sectors respectively, just over 4 percent of the CASs proposed such actions in the infrastructure sector." (World Bank 2003d).

Lastly, Quality Assurance Group (QAG) reviews are supposed to assess Bank operations for quality. It has been argued that QAGs measure the extent to which project staff follows Bank guidelines rather than the quality and effectiveness of Bank operations in reducing poverty and meeting other social objectives (Zuckerman 2001). The QAG produces annual Quality at Entry (QEA), Quality of Supervision (QSA) and Quality of Economic and Sector Work (QESW) reports. These reports summarize QAG assessments of individual projects and analytical work. Until recently, QAG reviews paid little attention to gender. For example, the 1999 QEA assessment questionnaire only cited gender once in parentheses as follows: "Project/Program social impacts disaggregated by social groups (e.g., gender) and adequate provisions made for mitigation of adverse impacts, if any?" In contrast, the same QEA questionnaire included multiple explicit environmental questions. According to gender anchor staff, both the QEA and QESW have new explicit gender questions asking if projects analyze gender, contain gender related actions, include women's participation, promote women's empowerment and monitor for gender. This is a major improvement over the previous parenthetical reference to gender. Hopefully the QSA questionnaire and other new QAG products will also be engendered.

4.1.6 New Gender Monitoring and Evaluation System

The gender anchor has developed and implemented the new monitoring and evaluation system that the Strategy calls for. The anchor solicited inputs from each of the regions and in turn synthesized these inputs into a report it sent to the Board in early 2003. According to the Strategy, vice-presidents take responsibility for submitting these monitoring reports. In reality, the burden belongs to the regional gender coordinators who all duly submitted their reports. Some regional gender coordinators complained that the information solicited was weak and unclear. Some regions submitted the best possible information under the circumstances while others made less of an effort. The gender anchor intends to strengthen the new monitoring system over time. It plans to provide stronger monitoring guidelines to the regions, develop a system for continuous rather than annual monitoring, and establish a standard monitoring format. Undoubtedly the monitoring system will be refined through experience. This Study would have benefited from reviewing the annual Strategy monitoring report that was submitted to the Board but it remains a

confidential document. This Study recommends that the gender monitoring system and results be transparently made available to the public.²⁶

4.2 Ongoing Strategy Targets

4.2.1 Mainstreaming Gender into Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs)

As noted above, the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund (IMF) introduced PRSPs as a prerequisite for the poorest countries participating in the Highly Indebted Poor Country (HIPC) initiative to have their Bank and Fund debts reduced.²⁷ Subsequently, the Bank and the Fund introduced PRSPs in non-HIPC low-income developing and transition countries too. PRSPs are required for Bank and Fund lending in increasing numbers of developing and transition countries. As of early 2003, over 20 countries had completed PRSPs and over 45 had produced Interim PRSPs (IPRSPs). PRSPs have become de facto Bank and Fund mandated national economic plans directed at reducing poverty. They are supposed to be “country-owned”, expressing not only government but also broad civil society interests solicited through participatory consultations. But their country ownership is felt less in their countries of origin than in the minds of development agency staff.

Today the Bank and Fund, most bilateral aid agencies, and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) all require PRSPs as a prerequisite for receiving development assistance. These agencies have been actively promoting and financing PRSP preparation. The Bank itself prepared an elaborate PRSP Sourcebook discussing in great detail what a PRSP should contain (World Bank 2001b). Recognizing that engendering PRSPs is critical for achieving their poverty reduction goals, the Gender anchor contributed a long chapter to the Bank PRSP Sourcebook on how to engender the PRSP. Anchor staff tried to engender other Sourcebook chapters.²⁸ The Bank has organized a number of workshops around PRSPs and gender, both at headquarters and regionally.

The Gender Strategy features a full page box presenting the good practice example of mainstreaming gender into the Cambodia Interim PRSP. The Strategy states that Country Directors are responsible for integrating country gender assessment findings into PRSP processes.

However, Gender Action’s in-depth audit of all 2002 PRSPs for gender issues demonstrates that of the 13 PRSPs produced that year, only 3 PRSPs address gender issues commendably but not completely (Malawi, Rwanda and Zambia), another 8 PRSPs spottily apply an outdated Women in Development approach, defining gender issues as reproductive health, girls’ education and a few other issues that vary by country, and the remaining two PRSPs almost neglect gender issues. Only two PRSPs

²⁶ Gender Action is a founding and active member of the Coalition for World Bank reform established in 2002 by about 30 international nonprofit organizations. The Coalition aims to make all activities of the taxpayer supported World Bank transparently available to the public.

²⁷ This introduction to PRSPs reflects some of the content of Zuckerman 2002a and Zuckerman and Garrett 2003.

²⁸ This Study’s lead author, working as a gender anchor consultant, and former anchor staff member Michael Bamberger, provided feedback to Sourcebook chapter authors on how to integrate gender issues into them.

promote women's rights (Malawi, Rwanda). Very importantly, no 2002 PRSP engenders structural adjustment measures like trade liberalization and privatization that are central to PRSPs despite the growing body of relevant analytical tools for doing so. Most PRSPs state that women are included in their participatory consultations but none breaks down the numbers of men and women consulted or indicates whether their surveys included gender related questions. Few PRSP contain sex-disaggregated data. Rwanda's is the only PRSP that tries to engender expenditures wherever possible. As pointed out above, this Gender Action analysis also found that the majority of Joint Staff Assessments that accompany PRSPs to the Bank and Fund Boards contain at best superficial gender analyses (Zuckerman and Garrett 2003).

Most regional coordinators have been sponsoring or participating in workshops to engender PRSPs. ECA provided an engendering PRSP workshop for former Council of Independent States PRSP stakeholders. But the two 2002 PRSPs that were weakest on gender, Albania and Tajikistan, were the only two ECA countries that produced PRSPs that year.

EAP organized a 2002 Gender Mainstreaming workshop in Hanoi, followed by national workshops in Cambodia and Laos. It might also support a PRSP and gender workshop for Mongolia. The Vietnam PRSP has integrated gender to some extent but provided no implementation strategy or budget to back up recommendations (Zuckerman 2002b and 2002c; Zuckerman and Garrett 2003).

In the South Asia Region (SAR), the Bangladesh PRSP is expected to mainstream gender. Bangladesh's Interim PRSP integrated gender issues more systematically than other I-PRSPs partly thanks to the Local Consultative Group on Women Advancement and Gender Equality (LCE WAGE sub-group) supporting this effort and very active civil society contributions. LCE WAGE sub-group is underwriting analyses and workshops to ensure the PRSP is engendered.²⁹ Bank SAR staff reported that Sri Lanka's PRSP and its first Poverty Reduction Support Credit (PRSC I) address important gender issues (SAR 2002).

The LAC gender unit has not targeted mainstreaming gender into PRSPs. Neither the Bolivia, Guyana nor Nicaragua PRSPs adequately address gender gaps (Zuckerman and Garrett 2002; Zuckerman 2002c).³⁰

Advocacy around engendering PRSPs still has a long way to go. Since unengendered PRSPs implicitly reinforce unequal gender patterns that hinder development, the Bank's Gender Director recommended that integrating gender into PRSPs be the priority of external advocacy around gender and the multilaterals. Gender Action is responding by collaborating with civil society groups in PRSP countries around the world. While PRSP engendering is starting to show results, more fundamental questions remain around country participation and ownership of PRSP content.³¹

²⁹ Gender Action is also playing an advocacy role on engendering the Bangladesh PRSP.

³⁰ MENA is not mentioned in this PRSP section since it does include PRSP countries.

³¹ Questions around country participation and ownership of PRSP content are explored in a series of Gender Action papers at www.genderaction.org.

4.2.2 Integrating Gender into World Bank Institute (WBI) Courses

Until recently, the World Bank Institute (WBI) combined training for client country participants and Bank staff. However, just in the last few months, Bank staff in-house training moved from the WBI portfolio to the Bank's Human Resource complex, its original home.

WBI courses do not yet systematically integrate gender but they are making a serious effort in that direction. Setting the framework, the new WBI Vice President expressed strong support for addressing gender issues at a Bank workshop that launched "Gender in Transition", an ECA gender analysis (Paci 2002). A seasoned Bank gender expert just moved to WBI as gender coordinator although this position is not located in a central WBI location. At least three other WBI staff and consultants in scattered units are gender experts. WBI is a large organizational bureaucracy containing multiple units that address gender gaps.

Today, only a few WBI course components mainstream gender because there are only a few gender advocates scattered around WBI. As a result of their efforts to integrate gender issues into specific sectors, the Community Empowerment and Social Inclusion Program (CESI), HIV/AIDs, and the Public Finance, Decentralization and Poverty Reduction initiatives contain engendered components.

In 2002, a gender consultant analyzed the extent to which WBI courses integrate gender and recommended how to expand gender coverage (Scott 2002). The analysis concluded that although a few courses integrate gender, large gaps remain. Some courses hardly integrate gender (such as Globalization and Macroeconomics; Trade; and Infrastructure Regulation), other courses integrate gender to some extent (such as Global Governance; Public Finance, Decentralization and Poverty Reduction, and Community Empowerment and Social Inclusion) and traditional women in development sectors integrate gender most deeply (such as the Leadership Program on HIV/AIDs; and Education). This replicates the pattern of gender analysis of all Bank products from investment projects to "country owned" Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers, where HIV/AIDs, education and reproductive health are by far the most engendered issues.

To expand gender integration across WBI sectors, Scott's recommendations included inter alia:

- Introducing gender training for all WBI program managers
- Producing gender tools for WBI staff
- Developing a WBI gender website
- Providing financial resources for gender mainstreaming of WBI programs.

WBI often co-sponsors training with other Bank units. In 2002, WBI and the gender anchor piloted a SAR regional distance learning workshop on integrating gender into program and project monitoring and evaluation. The Bank Sri Lanka Country Office hosted the workshop. WBI and SAR plan to host a distance learning workshop on gender-responsive budgeting for up to three countries (Pakistan, Afghanistan, Sri Lanka) in 2003. With MENA, WBI is planning a pension reform course that will promote women's participation. These are interesting but still isolated

initiatives since the majority of WBI training remains not engendered. But WBI training is likelier to integrate gender concerns systematically into its training sooner than is Bank lending.

4.2.3 Creating a Series of Technical Modules for Training Staff and Clients on Gender Issues

WBI is creating technical modules for training clients on gender issues. Some of the modules still provide in-house training for Bank staff such as the above mentioned SAR regional distance learning workshop on integrating gender into program and project monitoring and evaluation. For this training, the gender anchor provided the content and partnered with WBI in organizing this training. This training module is being adapted and unfolded in other regions.

WBI is developing gender training modules, for example, on gender and health, and on gender budgets for external clients. With LAC, it is developing a gender and land administration training module.

According to the gender anchor, the Bank's in-house training arm for staff, relocated to Human Resources, has not yet integrated gender into most of its training. The anchor intends to introduce gender into this in-house training.

A notable regional initiative has been LAC's gender training provided on demand to support Bank projects. For several years, LAC has pioneered annual workshops where project task managers and staff from Central American countries exchange information on good gender practices. In a future experiment, LAC will pilot these experiential learning exchanges among sectors.

To disseminate Strategy priorities, the gender anchor has been presenting training modules on Country Gender Assessments and mainstreaming gender into projects at network learning events like the annual Environmentally and Socially Sustainable Development (ESSD) and Poverty Reduction and Economic Management (PREM) "weeks". These "weeks" are actually a few days of training workshops for all network staff.

Other than the above mentioned official gender training events, addressing gender in Bank training is very sporadic and often forgotten. For example, the World Bank-World Vision daylong learning event, "Democratizing Development: Social Accountability Through Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs)", convened in the World Bank for the September 2002 Bank-Fund Annual Meetings, virtually did not mention gender issues although PRSPs must address them to achieve their objectives (Zuckerman 2002a). The word "gender" was mentioned only once in passing during the daylong series of Bank senior manager and staff presentations. No Bank gender specialists attended, neither from the gender anchor nor the regions.³² Upon inquiring, the Study authors learned that Bank gender experts were not notified about this event despite their desire to engender PRSPs. This Study recommends that

³² Both Gender Action and InterAction's Commission on the Advancement of Women attended the September 2002 PRSP workshop.

the Bank invite the Gender and Development Board to all Bank activities because gender is a cross-cutting issue as the Strategy underlines.

4.2.4 Developing Informal Learning Events

For many years, the WID and gender units have delivered informal WID and gender learning events for Bank staff. Brown bag luncheons have been the most popular informal learning event format because staff attendance tends to be higher during short lunch breaks than at longer training events. During lunchtime on any day, Bank staff can make choices among several brown bag lunch learning events. To attract participants, this competitive time slot requires presenters to be interesting and relevant.

The gender anchor and regional coordinators periodically organize ad hoc brown bag luncheons presentations. They cover a large range of topics, for example gender and information technology, engendering national budgets, the gendered impacts of armed conflict and the gender ramifications of Kuwait's constitution and laws. Frequently, these brown bag lunch events feature the results of work of Bank gender consultants. Sometimes they present gender data on project results, outcomes of gender projects or engendering tools for project managers. Occasionally they feature government, private or civil society initiatives that are compatible with the Bank's development approaches or that the Bank directly supports.

Bank gender experts have debated whether it would be effective to require mandatory gender training for all staff. So far, they have rejected this option as infeasible for very busy Bank staff.

This Study recommends that the Bank sponsor mandatory gender training for all staff and gender orientation for new staff and managers including and especially in country offices given the Bank's increasing decentralization. Since many countries offices do not have gender experts who could provide this training, the Bank needs to make special arrangements for gender experts to visit them or even better hire gender experts for each country office. Orientation for new staff is supposed to cover gender issues but one country chief economist reported that to meet this requirement he merely mentioned gender in his presentation to new staff. Bilateral agencies that have mandatory gender training for all staff and managers appear to have deeper gender mindsets although there are no studies that prove this outcome.

4.2.5 Template/Adaptable Tools

The Strategy promotes upgrading gender templates and sector toolkits to help staff integrate gender into their activities. Long before the Strategy appeared, the gender anchor had published sector toolkits on the central gender website for agriculture, transport, and water and sanitation. Also it had prepared briefing notes for several sectors. The India Country Office recently developed a toolkit on Gender in Resettlement and Rehabilitation that is being field tested and disseminated (South Asia 2002). These are valuable initiatives, but they only cover a thin slice of Bank

sectors. Hopefully the Strategy will accelerate coverage of other sectors. The critical outcome, getting project managers to use these tools, will remain an uphill struggle, unless the Bank mandates their use.

4.2.6 A Database on Where to Acquire Gender Expertise

At least two regions (AFR and LAC) developed gender expert databases long before the Strategy. Both regions' gender staff members feel these databases need updating. These lists are available to Bank staff but are not published on the Bank external gender web pages. Two other regions (MENA and SAR) do not have specific gender expertise databases and it is unknown if EAP and ECA have them.

4.2.7 Enhancing Engendering Tools on the Bank Website

The Strategy establishes the target to continuously enhance Bank website engendering tools. This section analyzes mainly the gender pages of the Bank's external website, www.worldbank.org/gender for quality and user-friendliness of the contents, as well as a few other Bank website topics.³³ The Bank has external and internal websites. The internal site or Bank Intranet, available only to Bank staff and consultants, contains more information on gender than does the external internet site.

On the external Bank website, the central gender anchor has developed rich "GenderNet" pages containing the Gender Strategy, policy documents, gender statistics ("Gender Stats") that include sex disaggregated data for many countries, sector tools, Bank publications on gender, PRSP and gender information, good practice examples of engendered Bank operations and links to other gender websites and other resources.

Among the regions, best efforts have been made by the three regions that have gender pages reachable from the GenderNet Homepage: Africa (AFR), Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC), and the Middle East and North Africa (MENA). However, these efforts were initiated several years ago but not updated recently. Regional gender interviewees volunteered that their gender web pages needed updating, citing lack of staff resources as the key impediment. The other three regions – East Asia and Pacific (EAP), South Asia (SAR), and Europe and Central Asia (ECA) – only have bits and pieces related to gender scattered on their web pages. These bits and pieces require a huge amount of labor to find. EAP and SAR present lots of information on their intranet gender web pages that are not available to the public. All the regions should present gender information on the Bank's external website.

Besides exploring the Bank gender pages through the sectors and topics and by region, we also examined World Bank Institute (WBI) web pages for gender content. At the time of this writing, the WBI site did not yet have dedicated gender pages. Apparently, the WBI pages include a resource section on gender budgeting, but it

³³ Most of the information in this analysis of the Bank website was prepared expressly for this Study by gender and development expert Hilary Sims Feldstein on behalf of Gender Action.

must take considerable digging to find it.³⁴ A WBI consultant gender analysis recommended developing WBI gender pages that would include a best practice database for gender mainstreamed WBI activities; engendered case study materials; announcements of gender-focused training events; and links to key World Bank and external gender sites (Scott 2002). With the arrival of a new WBI gender coordinator in 2003, Scott's recommendations will hopefully be followed up.

As a final check of Bank website pages, the Study authors selectively surveyed some Bank website pages on subjects that typically neglect gender to see if the Strategy and Bank messages around gender are influencing them. A look at the Private Sector Development (PSD) page indicated gender is not discussed despite women's increasing role in the private sector. PSD pages contain no obvious link to the micro-credit programs the Department supports that is conventionally associated with women. The PSD partnerships pages contain no links to initiatives to promote women's entrepreneurship. Our look at the Bank website Trade pages found one paper on gender and trade listed among publications but little else on women's role in trade despite a large number of initiatives outside the Bank addressing this issue. Our check of the Bank Transport home page indicated it contains no links to or mention of the gender anchor web pages on transport and gender. Nor does it refer to gender issues in any other way. Some other Bank web pages including the Conflict Prevention and Reconstruction and Health, Population and Nutrition pages integrate gender issues better.

This Study recommends that the Bank enhance gender linkages among its web pages to potentially expose many more staff to gender needs and tools. Table 2 below summarizes the findings of our Bank gender web page analysis (see also Annex 6).

Table 2. Bank Website Gender Pages (<http://www.worldbank.org/gender>)

Website Page	Gender Value	Sample Gender Content
Gender Anchor "GenderNet"	Rich dedicated gender website Easy to access	Gender Stats, Toolkits, Strategy, Policies, Best Practices, Links to AFR, LAC and MENA and partner organization gender websites
AFR	Rich but somewhat outdated gender site Easy to access	Consultant database, Country Focal points, NGOs, Publications, HIV/AIDs Content, PRSP discussion
EAP	No gender site found* Regional Sectors & Topics do not include gender	No gender content
ECA	No gender site found Regional Sectors & Topics do not include gender among them	Regional pages contain the publication, "Gender in Transition" (Paci 2002) Social development site cites the role of women very occasionally
LAC	Rich but somewhat outdated gender website Easy to access	Extensive publications on gender including Country Gender Reviews Engendered projects Regional gender employment statistics Research publications
MENA	Informative Easy to access	MENA Consultative Council on Gender Almost all regional topics address gender
SAR	No gender site found*	Inconsistent attention to gender in regional projects and country briefs
* The Bank Intranet that is not open to the public has additional gender pages but they are not available on the external Bank website.		

³⁴ The lead author could not find it through a quick WBI web pages search.

4.2.8.. Enhancing and Continuing Collaboration with Civil Society, Other Donors, and the UN System

Civil Society

The gender anchor has only limited collaboration with a few select civil society groups. These groups seem to be confined to the External Gender Consultative Group (EGCG). The anchor established EGCG as a result of civil society pressure on the Bank at the 1995 Beijing Fourth World Conference on Women to integrate gender better into Bank operations. EGCG membership has changed over the years. It has typically included between a half dozen and a dozen members from around the world, most of them excellent gender advocates. EGCG members contributed important feedback to drafts of this Strategy and to “Engendering Development” (World Bank 2001a).

Through 2000, the Bank financed the travel of EGCG members to Washington for a couple of days of intensive briefings and exchanges roughly every year and a half. Since 2000, there has only been one EGCG meeting in Washington. During the last couple of years, EGCG members lamented that they have been unable to maintain EGCG’s previous more intensive level of commitment.³⁵ The Bank is contemplating holding less frequent meetings with EGCG in Washington and is transforming EGCG into a broader electronic-based “grassroots” network. It expects this network will increase Bank-civil society communications. To develop this “grassroots” EGCG network, the gender anchor intends to request that those Bank Country Office civil society officers who are also gender focal points invite local gender group counterparts to join the EGCG electronic network. It is unknown if EGCG network members would be limited to a selective list or would include all interested groups. An electronic EGCG could globalize the external network to cover many more developing countries representatives than does the existing group. To enhance the possibility of grassroots groups influencing Bank initiatives through the electronic network, the network would need to encourage dialogue with Bank officials and not be confined to Bank information dissemination.

Besides the EGCG, at the regional level, a few years ago MENA developed its own NGO Consultative Council. The Council has played a valuable role in providing feedback on MENA gender initiatives. It periodically meets to provide advice to the regional gender coordinator.

At the country level, the India gender focal point has already initiated a local EGCG network and some other SAR countries might also develop such local networks.

External gender groups contribute in other ways to Bank products. For example, they provide advice on the Country Gender Assessments (CSAs) discussed below, such as the China and LAC country gender reviews.

Other Donors and the UN System

The gender anchor maintains considerable collaboration with other donors. The Bank Gender Director is an observer at the OECD Working Group on Gender. Bilateral

³⁵ Meetings between the lead author and the EGCG head and members during 2002.

donor agencies have underwritten key Bank gender initiatives. Examples include bilateral support for Engendering Development (World Bank 2001a) and for various Operations Evaluation Department analyses of gender mainstreaming in the Bank (OED 2000). Bilateral agencies have seconded gender experts to both the gender anchor and the regions. Overall, bilateral agencies have contributed heavily to Bank gender initiatives.

Also, the gender anchor collaborates closely with the UN system including with the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), Fund for Population Activities (UNFPA) and Fund for Women (UNIFEM). The Country Gender Assessments (CGAs) that the Strategy promotes will sometimes be collaborative products with UN partner agencies. For example, UNDP is contributing funds to prepare Madagascar's CGA. On a selective country basis, UNDP also supports gender integration into the preparation of some Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs) that the Bank requires of International Development Agency (IDA) borrowers. The gender anchor just completed an analysis of why gender is important for the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) that the UN formulated with inputs from the Bank and other stakeholders (World Bank 2003e).

4.3. Longer Term Targets – Foundations Laid and Progress Achieved

4.3.1 Preparing Country Gender Assessments (CGAs)

Preparing CGAs is the Gender Strategy centerpiece. The Strategy defines the essence of CGAs as "...a periodic assessment of gender issues in each country in which the Bank has an active lending program" (World Bank 2002a). The Strategy explains that the purpose of the CGA is to:

"analyze the gender dimensions of development; identify gender responsive policies and actions important for poverty reduction, economic growth, human well-being and development effectiveness in the country; and to integrate these policies and actions into policy dialogue and the country assistance program".

According to the Strategy, the CGA normally includes:

- A profile of male and female socioeconomic roles
- Gender disparities in access to, control over and use of assets and productive resources and in human development indicators
- Inequalities between males and females in the ability to participate in development decision making, laws, institutional frameworks, norms and other practices leading to gender discrimination
- The country context including the legal and regulatory framework and institutional arrangements
- A review of the gender dimensions of the Bank portfolio
- Gender responsive policy and operational interventions.

Like other Strategy priorities, CGAs are not new in the Bank. The WID unit introduced them during the 1980s. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, the Bank produced solid CGAs for Bangladesh, India, Kenya and Mexico and subsequently for other countries under a variety of names including country gender reviews, strategies, analyses, issues papers, assessments, etc. Between 1998 and 2000, the Bank produced over 15 CGAs including the China Country Gender Review discussed below (World Bank 2002b; (Zuckerman 2000a). The Strategy systematizes the preparation of CGAs for all countries for the first time. It replaces the previous ad hoc preparation of CGAs with a requirement that the Bank produce CGAs for every client country regularly. The Strategy states that Country Departments are responsible for preparing CGAs, that they produce one at least every five years for each country and that the first CGA for each country be produced by June 2005.

The Strategy also suggests that CGAs should not be blueprinted. It emphasizes that a CGA could be a free-standing document or part of another analytical product such a Poverty Assessment, depending on country resources and needs.

Country Departments would normally finance CGAs but Bank partner agencies could also underwrite CGAs. However, Country Department financing is desirable because it signals Bank commitment to promoting gender equality.

This Study expects that CGA quality is likely to vary across countries depending on many factors including the extent of stakeholder consultations, the degree of country ownership, the depth of data collection and fieldwork, and analysis of regional and local variations, *inter alia*. Past CGAs have been of varying quality depending on these factors (Zuckerman 2000a).

Each of the Bank's six regions is in a distinct phase of CGA preparation. As part of this Study's assessment of the extent to which the Strategy is being implemented, this Study describes the status of CGA preparation in each of the regions below. The uneven amount of information by region reflects the uneven status of CGA preparation.

Africa Region (AFR) – AFR needs to produce 37 CGAs by 2005. They are expected to be prepared on time but to be of varying quality because of inadequate funding. AFR country budgets are squeezed by other *mandatory* analytical work leaving little funding available for *optional* CGAs. Because of insufficient funding, the AFR gender coordinator considered piggybacking on mandatory analytical work such as the 30 Poverty Assessments (PAs) expected to be completed in the next two years. The coordinator rejected this option because regional PAs tend to contain weak gender analyses, typically mentioning female-headed households and girls' education but rarely addressing other important gender issues. PA guidelines lack strong gender criteria even after ten years of experience with them. AFR will prepare CGAs by patching together various funding sources including Bank Global Public Funds (central Bank funds), Country Department, bilateral, UNDP and other partner funds. No new AFR CGAs were complete at the time of drafting this Study but Ghana's and Benin's were expected soon. The region produced its own draft Africa Region Gender Strategy (ARGS) that elaborates a regional CGA production schedule (World Bank 2002c). Thinking ahead, the AFR gender coordinator is concerned that the region will mobilize resources to produce CGAs and publish them but will lack resources to implement CGA recommendations.

Eastern Europe and Central Asia (ECA) – ECA, unlike AFR, is trying to include CGAs inside country Poverty Assessments rather than producing them independently. The region is in an early stage of scheduling them.

East Asia and Pacific (EAP) – EAP has produced a regional CGA production schedule. It expects to produce three CGAs in each of fiscal year 2003 (Cambodia, China, Vietnam), fiscal year 2004 (Laos, Mongolia and the Philippines) and fiscal year 2005 (East Timor, Indonesia and Papua New Guinea). Of the regions' three remaining countries, the Bank is not planning to prepare CGAs for Malaysia and Thailand and it does not have the resources now to prepare one for the Pacific Island countries.

Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) – Prior to the strategy, LAC had already produced more CGAs than had other regions. In the second half of the 1990s, LAC developed a two-stage approach to mainstream gender into country work. The first stage was preparing a country gender review (CGR – another name for a country gender assessment -- CGA) that analyzed key country gender gaps and the Bank investment portfolio for gender and the second stage addressed gender issues in Bank projects. For economies of scale, LAC CGAs sometimes grouped countries, for example, it produced a CGA for five Central American countries and another for three southern cone countries. Recently LAC produced a Caribbean CGA covering three countries (Dominican Republic, Haiti and Jamaica). These multi-country CGAs analyze gender issues separately country by country but print them together to achieve savings. LAC has also produced individual CGAs for Ecuador and El Salvador. Encouragingly, LAC CGAs have not become shelf documents but have been used to engender Bank operations. This has been the result of the LAC gender unit proactively selling its gender expertise to Country Departments by promising to add value to Bank investments.

Middle East and North Africa (MENA) – Among the 10 borrower countries in MENA, only three CGAs are planned for now because of staff constraints. These are for Algeria, Egypt and Yemen.

South Asia Region (SAR) – SAR is preparing CGAs for five countries: Afghanistan, Pakistan, India, Nepal, and Bangladesh. These are all premised on extensive stakeholder consultations with donors, the government and NGOs with the focus on mainstreaming gender into operations. All of these CGAs are targeted for completion in fiscal year 2004. The timetable for other SAR country CGAs is uncertain.

In conclusion, CGAs run the risk of being ignored in project preparation and especially in implementation as have many poverty assessments and environmental assessments, both mandatory and recommended on a voluntary basis (Rich 2002). They provide important analyses of country gender gaps that projects should address and try to narrow, but the Bank must provide incentives to project staff that they lack today for them to use CGAs effectively.

5. Other Initiatives Advancing the World Bank Gender Strategy

5.1. Gender Anchor Initiatives

Since the Strategy appeared, the anchor has decided to emphasize three initiatives during the fiscal year 2003-04 to advance Strategy implementation. All of these initiatives, addressing weaknesses this Study identified, are needed and welcome:

- A publicity campaign to disseminate information about gender. Given the lack of awareness about the Strategy and the role of gender exhibited by Bank non-gender experts in our spot interviews, this initiative is badly needed. It seems like few non-gender experts have looked at the 8,000 Strategy copies that the gender anchor disseminated.
- Empowering gender focal points by helping them establish a communication network. Focal points, found to be performing very inconsistently, could benefit through a communication network. The Study authors did not hear details about this planned network but hope it would function as an Advisory service and information exchange. This format has benefited several Bank networks following the lead of the stellar Bank Education Advisory Service. Gender Action believes that a communications network can be a powerful tool for sharing information. However, empowering weak gender focal points requires much more than a communications network. To be effective, the focal points need to become gender experts who devote full time to engendering Bank projects in their countries.
- Engendering core Economic and Sector Work (ESW) including Public Expenditure Reviews, Poverty Assessments, Development Process Reviews, Country Economic Memoranda and financial reports. Previous analyses as well as this Study illustrate why core Economic and Sector Work need engendering (Zuckerman 2000b). The following paragraph from a gender analysis of Public Expenditure Reviews (PERs) contained in the Bank's first paper analyzing Bank macroeconomic policies and gender illustrates this point:

"PERs are Bank analyses which aim to make transparent to client countries and the Bank what the Government spends on, what it should spend on and where the resources would come from. PERs begin with a macroeconomic analysis followed by specific sector analyses. PER macroeconomic analyses tend to be devoid of people let alone gender concerns. Recent PERs have expanded their macroeconomic focus to include governance, corruption and accountability issues but there is still little or no mention of people. All PERs focus on poverty and equity and a few mention gender considerations in the chapters devoted to education, health, population and occasionally agriculture or other sectors. But PERs reviewed make no macroeconomic and gender linkages in their macroeconomic sections. It is recommended that PERs integrate gender considerations into their macroeconomic as well as microeconomic analyses to determine differential gender impacts."

Zuckerman 2000b

Following several unsuccessful EAP efforts to provide gender inputs into PERs, the region invited the gender anchor to provide assistance in integrating gender into

the Cambodia PER. The anchor sent a gender economist who provided assistance. As a result, the Cambodia PER integrates gender into various places and gender is being addressed in country budget work and civil service reform initiatives.

The SAR gender coordinator lamented that sometimes gender inputs for Public Expenditure Reviews do not get reflected in the final PER due to "space constraints" because "gender is the first item to get cut".

5.2. GENFUND

One initiative outside the Strategy worth mentioning is the GENFUND. GENFUND certainly promotes Strategy targets. In 2001, Norway established a Trust Fund for Gender Mainstreaming (GENFUND) that is now entering its third year of operation. During each of the first two years, Norway allocated about US\$0.5 million to GENFUND. For the third round, The Netherlands contributed a matching amount, raising the fund total to roughly US\$1 million. Project task managers are invited to submit proposals to compete for funding up to a maximum of US\$50,000. The funding must be used expressly to finance innovative project gender mainstreaming, providing good practice examples. In the 2002 round, GENFUND funded 10 projects selected from 42 proposals, of which half were in the Africa region. African countries are likely to continue to benefit disproportionately from the GENFUND because Norway places high priority on assisting them and because Dutch funds will be restricted to IDA eligible countries that include virtually all sub-Saharan countries.

5.3. Some Regional Initiatives

Africa: Since the Strategy appeared, the Africa regional gender coordinator produced the freestanding Africa Region Gender Strategy (ARGS) and a Work Program for fiscal year 2003-04 now in draft (World Bank 2002c). Some other regions, for example EAP in 2000, produced their own strategies before the Strategy appeared. AFR gender staff disseminated the ARGS in the region in late 2002, inviting feedback from regional network heads, country directors, and the Regional Leadership Team. ARGS argues that the "business case" for gender that the Strategy promotes needs to be translated into systematic integration of gender in regional operations and greater accountability by managers and staff. It focuses on engendering the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and proposes strengthening Country Office gender focal points. It promotes four "entry points": 1) "Gender and HIV-AIDs"; 2) "Gender and Poverty"; 3) "Engendering Economic Policy" (including integrating gender analysis and gender responsive budgeting into Public Expenditure Reviews and PRSPs); and 4) "Gender and Law". ARGS hopes the Africa region will move toward systematizing gender in operational work but emphasizes that the commitment of Country Directors must be strengthened to realize this goal. ARGS provides a good model of how regional network teams can mainstream gender in their work. Prior to the Strategy, AFR produced some valuable gender research analyzing the linkages between gender, growth, poverty and adjustment (Annex 4).

East Asia and Pacific: The Thailand based Gender Coordinator took the initiative to talk with each Country Director to identify possible projects for engendering. This Study already mentioned the EAP Vice President's initiative to convene a meeting with country gender coordinators and Directors to discuss gender. The new headquarters EAP gender coordinator, who co-authored Engendering Development, is introducing a strong regional gender research agenda that is likely to focus on labor market issues, trafficking problems and developing gender monitoring indicators that all Bank task managers and other staff could use.

Eastern Europe and Central Asia: In 2002 ECA published "Gender in Transition" (Paci 2002), a sweeping regional survey and analysis of the most pressing regional gender gaps and problems. They include post-socialist gender issues such as female disadvantages in the labor market, the gender implications of pension reforms, gender gaps in education and health, accelerating trafficking in women and children and violence against women. The ECA gender coordinator underlined that the Bank Gender Strategy presents typical gender issues and solutions that are not a strong fit for ECA's unique problems.

Middle East and North Africa: Gender has become one of five areas of strategic focus in the MENA region.³⁶ MENA prepared a Regional Gender Report timed for distribution at the World Bank-International Monetary Fund Annual Meeting in Dubai in September 2003.

6. Conclusions and Recommendations

A historical retrospective since the early 1970s when women in development and gender were not yet on the World Bank's radar screen suggests that substantial progress has been made in making gender a Bank priority. The Gender Strategy publication and dissemination indicate further progress.

However, the World Bank's mere \$600,000 one-year Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming to facilitate Strategy implementation during fiscal year 2002, the first year of the existence of the Gender Strategy, reflects the low priority gender commands among Bank priorities. Gender today is one of many Bank priorities. Other Bank priorities have stronger mandates than does gender. What is worse: The Strategy does not establish a plan to provide the resources needed to engender operations.

The revised Gender and Development OP and BP definitely improve on the preceding policy but they perpetuate an unfunded non-mandated Gender Strategy.

There are other obstacles to achieving Bank progress on gender issues:

There are too few gender experts. Many of the gender focal points who compose the majority of gender "experts" tend to be weak gender advocates.

Overall, there are two distinct camps on gender in the Bank. In one small camp are those working on gender and a few other gender advocates who are familiar with

³⁶ MENA's four other areas of strategic focus are: water, education, private sector development and public sector reform.

the Gender Strategy. The other very large camp consists of the majority of Bank staff who are unaware of the Strategy and among whom few promote gender equality objectives. The balance sheet on how the Gender Strategy is doing in the World Bank depends on whom you speak to.

This was the conclusion from our interviews that corroborate years of discussions by the lead author with Bank staff working across sectors around the world. Moreover, several regional gender coordinators estimated that probably less than five percent of their regions' economists had glanced at the Strategy.

The Strategy is premised on the assumption that with the preparation of Country Gender Assessments (CGAs) analytical and lending instruments will address gender issues. But this sequence might not unfold because the assumption ignores the consistent Bank track record of staff responding, albeit minimally, to mandatory incentives such as the required environmental Safeguard Policies and ignoring non-mandated and voluntary policies like gender's to accelerate Board approval. The Bank Safeguard Policies do not include the non-mandated gender policies.

CGAs run the risk of being ignored in project preparation and especially in implementation as have many poverty and environmental assessments (Rich 2002). CGAs provide important analyses of country gender gaps that projects should address, but the Bank must ensure that staff persons have incentives to integrate CGA content into operations.

Analysis of a representative sample of Bank analytical work, operations and the CAS in our case study of China, the Bank's largest client, indicate that none of these products seriously recognize nor address gender gaps despite the timely availability of the China Country Gender Review that is supposed to feed into the CAS and operations. Especially for operations, this is a pattern across countries in most sectors.

The main Strategy goal of preparing CGAs can be achieved, although CGAs will vary in quality depending on resources. However, the potential for translating the inconsistent CGAs into Bank investments is another matter. **The proof of Strategy effectiveness will be an engendered Bank investment portfolio that promotes women's rights and gender equality.** So far, too few resources are allocated to engendering large operations outside of the health and education sectors. Even health and education operations primarily address reproductive health and girls' education, by definition "gender issues," but tend to neglect broader issues concerning gender differentiated access to and types of health care available and gender stereotyped school curricula.

Most structural adjustment operations neglect gendered impacts, increasing poor women's already onerous home care burden, for example, shifting to them the additional tasks of caring for sick family members who previously used health care facilities that adjustment privatized and made unaffordable. A myriad of painful ramifications ensuing from adjustment program job retrenchment typically hurt women more than men: women are the first to be laid off and the last to be rehired. Moreover, women and children deeply share the consequences when husbands/fathers lose employment.

This Study concludes that the Gender Strategy has the following strengths and weaknesses:

Strategy strengths are that it:

- Systematizes previously ad hoc best practices especially preparing Country Gender Assessments.
- Presents the “business case” for gender, based on the argument that gender inequalities limit economic growth.
- Creates a centralized/decentralized monitoring and reporting system.
- Encourages Bank gender advocates to launch new gender initiatives.
- Provides some impetus for senior managers to embrace gender concerns. A key determinant of the Strategy’s potential success will be political commitment by Bank senior managers.
- Augments the arsenal of tools for Bank gender advocacy.

Strategy weaknesses are that it:

- Lacks mandates to require Bank staff to become familiar with or embrace its core message to promote gender equality. Despite strong Strategy dissemination efforts, only a minority of managers and staff have read the Strategy and many are unaware of its existence. Similarly, very few Bank non-gender experts have looked at any Bank gender web pages.
- Lacks a more meaningful accountability mechanism than the new Strategy implementation confidential monitoring system.
- Is ineligible for the Independent Inspection Panel review mechanism of policy breaches because the gender policy is not mandated.
- Expects CGAs will translate into engendering operations but without incentives and sanctions, it is likely that many staff and managers will not engender Bank activities.
- Depends on Country Directors who control Bank funds to allocate resources to address gender gaps but Country Directors allocate funding for mandated issues first and then distribute additional resources, if any, for only a fraction of many competing claims including gender.
- Gives women’s rights much less weight than the economic “business case”.
- Addresses macroeconomic policies weakly despite the Bank’s deep role in influencing country macroeconomic policy and financing structural adjustment programs – including Poverty Reduction and Development Policy Support Credits – that contain “conditionalities” and/or reward other macroeconomic reforms having particularly harmful effects on poor women.

To ensure Strategy effectiveness, this Study recommends that the Bank:

- Mandate addressing gender gaps and issues in all Bank activities. Without mandates, Bank staff lack incentives to address gender issues. Mandates made

a difference for the environment. The lack of mandates is equivalent to applying a set of brakes on Strategy implementation.

- Expand the number of gender experts significantly.
- Place gender experts strategically in all networks in order to meet the Strategy goal of mainstreaming gender into all Bank activities.
- Locate empowered gender experts in each Bank country office and charge them with engendering every operation from identification and design through implementation and ensuring that Bank investments address key country gender problems such as trafficking in poor vulnerable women and girls.
- Incorporate gender rigorously into the Quality Assurance Group Supervision questionnaires as it is doing to other QAG questionnaires.
- Accelerate engendering non-gender Operational Policies that are very influential in the Bank project cycle.
- Invite the Gender and Development Board and gender anchor routinely to all, not just some, Bank activities because gender is a cross-cutting issue as the Strategy underlines.
- Arrange for all the regions to present their gender activities and research on the Bank external website and enhance gender linkages among web pages to potentially expose more stakeholders to gender needs and tools.
- Make public the gender monitoring system reports sent to the Board of Directors that measure Strategy implementation.
- Create real accountability mechanisms beyond the new internal monitoring reporting system.

References

- Association for Women's Right in Development (AWID). 2002. The World Bank and Women's Rights in Development. Facts & Issues No. 5, October 2002.
- Association for Women's Right in Development (AWID). 2003. How Can Gender Equality be Promoted at the World Bank? An Interview with Carolyn Long. Resource Net Friday File. Issue 124, May 2, 2003.
- Blackden, Mark and Bhanu, Chitra. 1999. Gender, Growth and Poverty Reduction. Special Program of Assistance for Africa, 1998 Status Report on Poverty in Sub-Saharan Africa. World Bank. Washington, DC.
- Blackden, Mark and Elizabeth Morris Hughes. 1993. "Paradigm Postponed: Gender and Economic Adjustment in Sub-Saharan Africa." World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Cunningham, Wendy. 1999a. "The Substitution of Non-Market Work Among Household Members." LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Cunningham, Wendy. 1999b. "Feminization of the Informal Sector in LAC". LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Cunningham, Wendy. 1998. "Breadwinner Vs. Caregiver: Labor Force Patterns of Household Heads Over the Mexican Business Cycle." LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Detjen, J. 1999. "Integrating Gender in Public Sector Modernization." LCSPR. World Bank, Washington, D.C.
- Long, Carolyn. 2003. The Advocate's Guide to Promoting Gender Equality at the World Bank. Women's Edge.
- Operations Evaluation Department (OED). 2000. "Integrating Gender in World Bank Assistance." World Bank. Washington, DC.
- Paci, Pierella. 2002. Gender in Transition. World Bank Eastern Europe and Central Asia Region.
- PREMGE. 1999. "Gender in the FY98-FY99 CAS Retrospective Review." World Bank draft mimeograph.
- Rich, Bruce. 1994. Mortgaging the Earth: The World Bank, Environmental Impoverishment, and the Crisis of Development. Beacon Press.
- Rich, Bruce. 2002. "The World Bank Under James Wolfensohn." Chapter 2 in Jonathan Pincus and Jeffrey Winters, eds, Reinventing the World Bank. Cornell University Press.
- Royaume du Maroc. 1999. *Morocco Gender Plan of Action*. Morocco.
- Scott, Roxanne. 2002. Strategy for Mainstreaming Gender in World Bank Institute Programs. World Bank draft mimeograph.
- South Asia Region (SAR). 2002. Global Public Goods Incentive Fund for Gender Mainstreaming. FY02 Progress Report.

Tinker, Irene. 1990. *Persistent Inequalities: Women and World Development*. New York. Oxford University Press.

World Bank. 2001a. *Engendering Development: Through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice*. Policy Research Report. Oxford University Press. Summary available at www.worldbank.org/gender/prr.

World Bank. 2001b. *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Sourcebook*. Available in English, Spanish, French and Russian at www.worldbank.org/poverty/strategies.

World Bank. 2002a. *Integrating Gender into the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action*. Available at www.worldbank.org/gender/overview/sps/home.htm.

World Bank. 2002b. *China: Country Gender Review*.
Chinese version: www.worldbank.org.cn/Chinese/content/gender-cn.pdf.
English version: www.worldbank.org.cn/English/content/gender-en.pdf.

World Bank. 2002c. *Africa Region Gender Strategy & FY03-04 Work Program*. Gender Team Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Africa Region.

World Bank. 2003a. *Memorandum of the President of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development and the International Finance Corporation to the Executive Directors on a Country Assistance Strategy of the World Bank Group for the People's Republic of China*.

World Bank. 2003b. *Operational Manual*. Operational Policy 4.20. Gender and Development. Available at:
<http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual/nsf/Opolw?OpenView>

World Bank. 2003c. *Operational Manual*. Bank Procedure 4.20. Gender and Development. Available at:
<http://wbln0018.worldbank.org/institutional/manuals/opmanual/nsf/Bprow?OpenView>

World Bank. 2003d. *Country Assistance Strategies: Retrospective and Future Directions*. Discussion Draft for the March 26, 2003 Committee on Development Effectiveness.

World Bank. 2003e. *Gender Equality and the Millennium Development Goals*. Gender and Development Group. Available at:
www.worldbank.org/gender/gendermdg.pdf.

Zuckerman, Elaine and Ashley Garrett. 2003. *Do Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers Address Gender Issues? A Gender Audit of 2002 PRSPs* Available at:
www.genderaction.org.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2000a. *Country Gender Review Guidelines*: World Bank. Draft.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2000b. *Macroeconomic Policies and Gender in the World Bank*. Background paper for *Integrating Gender into the World Bank's Work: A Strategy for Action*.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2001. *Study of the Role, Functions and Impact of the World Bank's Quality Assurance Group (QAG) and Financial Management/ Loan Administration Policies and Procedures*. Internal IDB Document. December 2001.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2002a. *A Primer on Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers and Gender*. Available at: www.genderaction.org.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2002b. 'Engendering' Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs): the issues and the challenges. *Gender and Development*, An Oxfam Journal, Volume 10, Number 3, 2002, Oxford. Available at: www.genderaction.org.

Zuckerman, Elaine. 2002c. Evaluation of Gender Mainstreaming in Advocacy Work on Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSPs). Paper prepared for Oxfam, Great Britain. Available at: www.genderaction.org

The Authors

Elaine Zuckerman, president and founder of the Washington-based NGO Gender Action, worked inside the multilateral development banks (MDBs) for two decades. In the 1980s, Elaine created the first World Bank advocacy program to prevent the harmful impacts of structural adjustment loans on the poor, especially women. She served on the AWID Board of Directors during the 1980s. In the MDBs and as a consultant to bilateral aid agencies and civil society organizations such as the International Center for Research on Women and Oxfam, she worked in China, Latin America, Africa and Eastern Europe on gender, poverty, poverty reduction strategies, the social impact of macroeconomic policies and structural adjustment reforms, social investment funds, education and health financing and rural development and environment projects. Elaine studied in China for three years during the Cultural Revolution. She speaks and reads Chinese, French and Spanish.

Wu Qing is a leader of the Chinese women's movement. She is president of the China Women's Health Network, which was established in 1996 in Beijing, China and provides hotline counseling and free legal services to women throughout the country. CWHN also provides training in community building. She is also president of the Women's World Summit Foundation based in Geneva, Switzerland. In addition, she serves as an adviser of the *Rural Women Knowing All Magazine* published in China. She has been elected as People's Deputy to the Haidian District and Beijing Municipal People's Congresses in consecutive terms. In 2002, she was named Social Entrepreneur Winner of the Schwab Foundation for Social Entrepreneurship and in 2001 she was an Awardee of the Ramon Magsaysay Award for Public Service (nicknamed the Asian Nobel Prize). She serves on the board of Gender Action and is also the honorary chair of the Women's Intercultural Network.

Annexes

Annex 1:

Persons Interviewed

Name	Institution/Position
	WORLD BANK GENDER EXPERTS
Blackden, Mark	Gender Coordinator, AFR
Chamlou, Nadereh	Gender Coordinator, MENA
Fort, Lucia	Gender Expert, Gender and Development Group
Hooper, Emma	Former Acting Gender Coordinator, Consultant, SAR
King, Beth	Gender Co-Coordinator, EAP
Mason, Karen	Director, Gender and Development Group, Gender Board
Paci, Pierella	Gender Coordinator, ECA
Scott, Roxanne	Gender Expert, Consultant, WBI
Tornquist, Annika	Gender Expert, Consultant, LAC Gender Unit
Van den Oever, Pietronella	CESI Group, WBI
	FORMER WORLD BANK GENDER EXPERT
Herz, Barbara	Former WID Unit Chief, World Bank
	WORLD BANK NON-GENDER EXPERTS
	<i>Note: Bank non-gender experts' names were removed to encourage them to provide frank answers.</i>
Anonymous	Country Director, MENA
Anonymous	Sector Director, MENA
Anonymous	Task Manager, ECA
Anonymous	Senior Auditor, Internal Audit Department; Former Regional Task Manager and Economist, SAR
Anonymous	Agricultural Economist, EAP
Anonymous	Lead Sanitary Engineer, AFR
Anonymous	Chief Country Economist, Country Office, SAR

Annex 2

Interview Questions for Gender-Expert World Bank Staff

Note: Interviews are a dynamic process so any of the questions below spawned others and interviewees often volunteered information outside the lists below. Some interview questions have a Gender Board, other a regional focus.

Are you or who is your regional gender coordinator?

To which network does your regional gender coordinator belong?

To whom does your regional gender coordinator report?

How is the regional gender focal points system working? How many regional country offices have the regional gender focal points?

What new gender policies, projects, ESW or other initiatives have been developed in your region or Bankwide since the Strategy approval?

Do you think all or some of Bank managers and staff aware of the new Strategy?

How do Bank staff and managers interpret the Strategy?

How do they perceive it affects their work?

The 2000 Bank macro policy and gender study concluded that many Bank staff persons were confused about the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming (Zuckerman 2000b). Has the Strategy changed or is it changing that?

What do you perceive as Strategy strengths and weaknesses?

How are the Strategy's explicit targets being met?

1) Year One:

- Produce of annual gender mainstreaming progress reports by Regional Vice Presidents and the Gender Board
- Create the first template/adaptable tool to help staff integrate gender into work
- Generate a database on where to acquire gender expertise
- Prepare new Operational Policy and Bank Procedures statements on gender and development
- Ensure adequate staff resources for fully implementing the strategy are available
- Provide incentive funding: Amount and for what?
- Develop and implement a new gender monitoring and evaluation system

2) Ongoing:

- Integrate gender into WBI courses
- Enhance engendering tools on the Bank's website
- Provide incentive funding
- Enhance and continue collaboration with civil society, other donors, and the UN system

3) What foundations has the Bank laid and what progress has it achieved toward meeting longer term targets?

- Prepare Country Gender Assessments: Which countries and what kind of CGAs given past range? What do they include? Bank portfolio reviews? Key gender gaps? Donor reviews? Literature reviews? Statistics etc.? How were they prepared? Participatory? Fieldwork? Other?
- Mainstream gender into PRSPs, JSAs, CASs, sector strategy papers, quality assurance assessments
- Create a series of technical modules for training staff and clients on gender issues
- Develop informal learning events
- Incorporate gender dimensions into other operational policies

4) Responsibilities of Regional Vice Presidents:

- Provide pro-active leadership on integrating gender mainstreaming within region
- Approve, update and ensure implementation of regional gender action plans and production of regional annual gender mainstreaming progress report
- Hold Country Directors accountable for timely CGA completion, for integrating findings in a timely way into country dialogue and the CAS
- Hold Sector Directors/Managers accountable for integrating gender issues into sector strategies, programs and projects in priority sectors and issues identified in CGA
- Ensure JSAs pay adequate attention to gender issues
- Ensure Country Directors have adequate resources to assist regional staff with gender mainstreaming

Annex 3

Interview Questions for World Bank Non Gender-Experts

Where are you working in the Bank?

Have you heard of the Bank Gender Strategy the Board endorsed in 2001?

If so:

- Have you read it?
- Are you aware of its contents?
- Has it influenced or changed your work in any way?
- What do you perceive as its strengths and weaknesses?
- Do you have resources to implement the gender Strategy?
- Do you have any incentive to implement it?

Do you think all or some of Bank managers and staff who are not gender experts are aware of the new Strategy and if so, has it affected their work?

Do you ever look at the Bank's gender websites?

Have you considered the meaning of gender and gender mainstreaming?

If so, do your Bank activities mainstream or integrate gender issues and if so how?

Do you know who your regional gender coordinator is?

Have you had any gender training?

Annex 4

Good Practice Examples of World Bank Gender and Macroeconomic Research

(Quoted from Zuckerman 2000b)

Africa (AFR): The Africa region has produced important ESW analyzing the linkages between gender, growth, poverty and adjustment (Blackden and Bhanu 1999; Blackden and Morris-Hughes 1993).³⁷ This research combines macromodeling and microeconomic gender analysis of household survey data to demonstrate that reducing gender inequalities enhances growth, efficiency and welfare. It recommends policy actions to increase macroeconomic growth through microeconomic interventions like investing in labor-savings techniques to reduce SSA women's onerous work burden and enhance access of poor women and men to assets and production techniques.

Latin American and the Caribbean (LAC): The LAC gender team has initiated a substantial body of analytical work examining the impact of adjustment measures like privatization and trade liberalization on men's and women's welfare and employment patterns (Cunningham 1998,1999a and 1999b; Detjen 1999).³⁸ It examines the extent to which men and women in recession and adjustment leave school, lose jobs and find new employment where. The research is based on household surveys and focus groups following people over one to two years. LAC ESW demonstrates that without an unemployment insurance safety net protecting retrenched men during privatization, former housewives are forced to join the labor market. In tandem, trade liberalization and globalization are also drawing women into the labor market, especially in export assembly manufacturing and in services. As this employment shift occurs, there is evidence in some LAC countries of men increasing their contribution to housework and childcare.

Annex 5

Select Gender Indicators

	Female % of Labor Force	% Female Illiteracy	% Male Illiteracy	Total Fertility Rate – Births per Woman	Female Life Expect- ancy at Birth	Male Life Expect- ancy at Birth
EAP	44	22	9	2.1	70	67
ECA	46	6	2	1.7	73	64
LAC	34	14	12	2.7	73	66
MENA	27	50	27	3.7	68	66
SAR	33	63	36	3.5	63	62
SSA	42	50	34	5.5	52	49

Source: World Development Report 2000, World Bank.

³⁷ The papers referenced are a sample of ongoing and completed analysis linking macroeconomic policy, adjustment and gender. For a complete list, contact Mark Blackden who coordinates AFR gender work, mblackden@worldbank.org.

³⁸ The papers referenced are a sample of ongoing and completed LAC ESW linking macroeconomic policy, adjustment and gender. For a complete list, contact Wendy Cunningham who coordinates LAC analytic work, wcunningham@worldbank.org.

Annex 6

World Bank Internet Web Pages on Gender (www.worldbank.org/gender)

(Compiled by Hilary Sims Feldstein)

GENDER NET MAIN PAGE

Overview	Mainstreaming Gender	
	Gender & Development in the World Bank	
	Policy Documents	
	About GenderNet	
Resources/Tools	Sector Tools and Briefing Notes.	Agriculture and Water Sanitation Toolkits Several Briefing Notes
	Bank publications on Gender	Listed by sector and country
	Gender Stat	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Summary Gender Profile • Thematic Data • Gender Monitoring • Data by regions
	Gender & Social Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Social Assessment Overview • Gender in Social Assessment • Task Team Leaders' Guide And others
	Link to Development Gateway: Gender Site	Interactive site on sustainable development and poverty reduction with specifics on gender and development
Practical examples	Bank Operations	
	Practical Examples of incorporating gender	
	PRSPs and Gender	
	Gender and the Digital Divide	
	Gender and Transport	
	Gender and Rural Development	

AFRICA REGION GENDER SITE

TOPIC		
Key Resources	Data Resources & Contacts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender Contacts at World Bank Headquarters • Gender Contacts in WB Country Offices • NGOs and individual contacts in the countries • Government and University contacts in the countries • Gender contacts in International Organizations
	Africa Country Gender Database	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender Country Profiles (map & search for specific country info), e.g. Tanzania Summary Gender Profile
	WB Gender Publications	
	Africa Region "Findings" and "Infobriefs" on Gender	
Projects and Programs	WB Africa Region Projects with gender components	
	WB lending gender related operations	
	Search of WB projects with gender components	
	Gender and Poverty Reduction	

	The gender dimensions of HIV/AIDS	
	Summary issues note on gender and AIDS in SSA	
	Deininger et al paper on AIDS Orphans in SSA	
	Keynote speech on gender, sexuality and HIV/AIDS given by Geeta Rao Gupta at July 2000 Durban AIDS conference	
	Cross reference to the "Findings" on AIDS in African Universities (#188, Aug 2001)	
	Gender and Law in Sub-Saharan Africa	
Training Materials	"Gender, Health and Poverty" Distance Learning Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Module 2: "Gender, Growth and Poverty in SSA: A Framework for Analysis" (Eng & Fr) Module 6: "Too Much Work and Too Little Time: The Gender Dimensions of Energy, Water and Transport." (Eng & Fr)
	Gender and the Digital Divide	WB GenNet site: Series of 25 papers on the impact of ICT on gender relations and innovative ways that ICTs are being used to overcome gender inequalities.
Related Links in the Bank	Gender Net	
	PRSPs	
	HIV/AIDS	
External Links	African Development Bank	
	Women of Africa Resources	
	UNECA – African Center for Women	ECA sites, ACW papers (1999), links to other gender/WID sites.
	The Women in Development Network (WIDNET)	Links to Focus International that has information on Africa via PANAF.NET, and on WID worldwide including regional sites through WIDNET. Also sites on Business and Management.

EAST ASIA AND PACIFIC

No separate gender page or source found

In the Region	Regional Brief	
	Data and Statistics: reference to a number of data bases for this region.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In WDR, female youth illiteracy is given at 4% In WB Database: Illiteracy rate separately for males and females No. girls in primary and secondary schools by % <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Prevalence of HIV females 15-24
	Economic Prospects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> GEP 2003: basically trade and markets
Projects and Operations	Loans and Credits	Not possible to scan by theme and region together
	Monthly Operational Summary	Long list of very short summaries of projects of which 3—Cambodia 1 PHN & Philippines 2 PHN & Social Sector—mention women.
	Projects, Policies & Strategies	Goes to WB wide list of projects and provides selection by country in the region.

Selected Reports and Publications		Some 24 documents available online, but not in a form that allows a global search for those mentioning 'gender' or 'women'. Would have to go through one by one. Eleven listed as available through InfoShop, but the full text is not available online.
Sectors and Topics	Anticorruption	Each of these is lists of projects, but 'gender' and 'women' are rarely in the short summaries.
	ASEM Trust Fund	
	Global Development	
	Learning Network	
	Energy and Mining	
	HIV/AIDS	
	Trade and Poverty	
	Urban Development	
	Water Resources Management	

SOUTH ASIA

No separate gender page or source found

In the region	Regional Brief	
	Annual Report	
	Speeches	
	Sectors	Review of several topics shows that women are considered and/or some simple gender analysis is used in some projects.
Data and Publications	Data & Statistics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Illiteracy rate separately for males and females • No. girls in primary and secondary schools by % • Prevalence of HIV females 15-24
	Regional publications	
Countries	Country briefs overview	A review of the first three countries—Afghanistan, Bangladesh, and Bhutan showed some attention to disaggregated data for results and/or planning.
Projects	Project Page	
	Partnerships	
	Projects in Action	Out of 11, 2 projects specify women (1), girls (1) in the title. Several projects did not come up when clicked.
	Evaluations	On a search of Published evaluations for 'gender' in South Asia, 38 publications, going back to December 94. Fifty two projects came up with "women"; 21 for "women and men"; 21 for "men and women". Several studies are bank-wide studies that include the key word(s).

ECA REGION

No separate gender page or source found

In the Region	Unexamined		
Data and Publications	Regional Data profile	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only gender related data was the % of girls enrolled in primary and secondary schools 	
	Publications	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gender in Transition by Pierella Paci 	
Topics and Sectors	Community Driven Development		
	Social Development: Themes	Beneficiaries	
		Expected Outputs and Activities	
		Under the SDI the following activities implemented	
		SDI may include the following areas of analysis and design of projects	
		Integrating social inclusion concerns in post conflict reconstruction	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide a special focus on gender and children in the vulnerability analysis
		Improve prospects for youth, especially unemployed youth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Stimulate interaction between youth in the various countries Identify and pilot specific programs to deal with issues of violence, drug abuse, human trafficking among youth
	Social Development: Projects: Operational Work	Macedonia: Children & Youth...	Repeated mention of 'children and youth' and mention of "youth and human rights"
		Northern Albania and Kosovo: Childhood development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Enhance role of women as mediators and agents of non-violent conflict Beneficiaries include (ii) mothers (child health and education and their own empowerment), fathers.
		Kosovo	
		Croatia	
	Social Development: Projects: analytical work	Kosovo: Conflict and Change: Impact on Institutions	
		Bosnia & Herzegovina: Local level institutions	
		Albania: Qualitative Poverty Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Among the 16 dimensions for focus, "gender" is included Among informal associations, youth groups, age groups, and women groups, and men groups are mentioned.
Useful Links & Sources		None mentioned	

Silk Road: Smithsonian Folklife- World Bank Partnership	Related Links		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Link to WBMDG such as promoting gender equality and empowering women.
---	---------------	--	---

LATIN AMERICA & THE CARIBBEAN GENDER SITE

New Policy Research Working Papers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are Men Benefiting from the New Economy? Male Economic Marginalization in Argentina, Brazil, and Costa Rica • Female Wage Inequality in Latin American Labor Markets • Children's Work and Schooling: Does Gender Matter? Evidence from the Peru LSMS Panel Data • Breadwinner or Caregiver? How Household Role Affects Labor Choices in Mexico • Sectoral Allocation by Gender of Latin American Workers over the Liberalization Period of the 1990s • Methodologies to Measure the Gender Dimensions of Crime and Violence • Gender and the Allocation of Adult Time, Evidence from the Peru LSMS Panel Data
Forthcoming Reports	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Brazil Gender Review: Issues and Recommendations • A Review of Gender Issues in the Dominican Republic, Haiti and Jamaica
Who we are & What we do	Contact information and areas of work
Gender Operational Support Fund (GOSF) for LAC	Description and examples of projects
Publications and Ongoing Research	Lists LAC Gender publications by sector and by country
Gender Statistics	Labor force participation, for selected countries (Argentina, Brazil, Costa Rica), three different years.
	Gender Wage Gap, for selected countries (Argentina, Brazil, Costa Rica), three different years
	Unemployment statistics by gender for selected countries (Argentina, Brazil, Costa Rica), except Historic which is for 18 countries in LAC.
Gender Resources and Analytical Tools (GREAT) Training Program	A list of recent workshops and seminars
	Key Questions in Gender Analysis: Sectoral Reference Guides
Link to World Bank Gender Home Page	
Link to External Gender-related Sites	
Links to other LAC topics	

MIDDLE EAST & NORTH AFRICA GENDER SITE

Gender in MNA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • MNA Consultative Council on Gender • Access to Basic Services through Registration (Egypt) • Cultural Expression and Poverty Reduction (Yemen) • Work in Progress: Ratification of International Conventions by country • Promoting Gender Awareness among WB staff: brown bag lunches on specific subjects.
Selected Gender Statistics	By country by theme.	Essentially moves into a separate section on Gender Stats for which you can look up any country by theme
Related MNA sectors	Economic Policy	These are links to these topic areas for the whole MNA region. Except in Social Development, gender is not addressed. In SD, it is stated that the Social Development Team for MNA are involved in the Gender thematic groups
	Poverty	
	Public Sector	
	Social Development	
	Health	
	Education	
Research	References and summaries of 5 – 10 gender-related research on different sets of topics.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Engendering Development through Gender Equality in Rights, Resources, and Voice • Poverty and Social Welfare • Human Development • Environment, Agriculture, Rural Development and NRM • Infrastructure and Urban Development • Macroeconomics and International Economics • Finance and Private Sector Development • Transition Economies • Public Sector Management
Partnerships	External Gender Consultative Group	
	MENA Consultative Council on Gender	
	Bilateral and Multilateral	
	GenFund	Norwegian fund for mainstreaming gender
	Related Links	
Events	Calendar of Events	
	Bank Gender Activities	
Related Links	Statistics	
	Regional World Bank Gender Sites	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Africa Region and Gender • Latin America and the Caribbean • Middle East and North Africa
	World Bank Sector Sites	
	United Nations Agencies	
	Bilateral Organizations	
	Multilateral Organizations	
	Non-Government Org.	
	Academic and Research Organizations	

Acronyms

AFR	Africa
AWID	Association for Women's Rights in Development
BP	Bank Procedure
CAS	Country Assistance Strategy
CESI	Community Empowerment and Social Inclusion Program
CGA	Country Gender Assessment
CGR	Country Gender Review (another name for a CGA)
ECA	Eastern Europe and Central Asia
EAP	East Asia and Pacific
EGCG	External Gender Consultative Group
ESSD	Environmentally & Socially Sustainable Development
ESW	Economic and Sector Work
FSN	Financial Sector Network
GAD	Gender and Development
HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Country
HD	Human Development
HDN	Human Development Network
IDA	International Development Association
IMF	International Monetary Fund
JSA	Joint Staff Assessment
LAC	Latin America and the Caribbean
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MENA	Middle East and North Africa
OED	Operations Evaluation Department
OP	Operational Policy
PAD	Project Appraisal Document
PRR	Policy Research Report
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSD	Private Sector Development
PSI	Private Sector and Infrastructure
PREM	Poverty Reduction and Economic Management
PRMGE	Poverty Reduction and Economic Management Network Gender and Development Unit (also called the "gender unit" and the "gender anchor")
QAG	Quality Assurance Group
QEA	Quality at Entry
QESW	Quality of Economic and Sector Work
QSA	Quality of Supervision
SAR	South Asia Region
SAR	Staff Appraisal Report
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
WBI	World Bank Institute
WEWB	Women's Eyes on the World Bank
WID	Women in Development

Heinrich Böll Foundation

The Heinrich Böll Foundation, affiliated with the Green Party and headquartered in the Hackesche Höfe in the heart of Berlin, is a legally independent political foundation working in the spirit of intellectual openness.

The Foundation's primary objective is to support political education both within Germany and abroad, thus promoting democratic involvement, sociopolitical activism, and cross-cultural understanding.

The Foundation also provides support for art and culture, science and research, and developmental cooperation. Its activities are guided by the fundamental political values of ecology, democracy, solidarity, and non-violence.

By way of its international collaboration with a large number of project partners - currently numbering about 150 projects in almost 60 countries - the Foundation aims to strengthen ecological and civil activism on a global level, to intensify the exchange of ideas and experiences, and to keep our sensibilities alert for change. The Heinrich Böll Foundation's collaboration on sociopolitical education programs with its project partners abroad is on a long-term basis. Additional important instruments of international cooperation include visitor programs, which enhance the exchange of experiences and of political networking, as well as basic and advanced training programs for committed activists.

Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung, Hackesche Höfe, Rosenthaler Str. 40/41, D-10178 Berlin

Tel: ++49/30/285348; Fax: ++49/30/28534109

info@boell.de www.boell.de

The Heinrich Boell Foundation North America:

Since 1998, the Heinrich Boell Foundation has an office in Washington, DC. The Washington office focuses its work on the issues of global governance (including global environmental governance, international trade and finance matters), sustainable development, social equity and gender democracy.

Heinrich Böll Foundation; 1638 R Street, NW, Suite 120; Washington, DC 20009, U.S.A

Tel: ++1-202-462-7512; Fax: ++1-202-462-5230

info@boell.org www.boell.org

Böll Partners for this Study:

Gender Action, established in 2002, is a nonprofit global advocacy campaign dedicated to ensuring the International Financial Institutions (IFIs) promote women's rights and gender equality.

Elaine Zuckerman, President

Gender Action

1443 S Street, NW, Unit 2

Washington, DC 20009

Tel: ++1-202-234-7722

Email: elainez@genderaction.org

<http://www.genderaction.org>

China Women's Health Network, established in 1996 in Beijing, China, provides hotline counseling and free legal services to battered and other disadvantaged women. CWHN also trains trainers in community building to make communities a safer place for women and children.

Wu Qing, President

China Women's Health Network

No. 11 Zhang Jing Hutong, Tong Cheng District

100007 Beijing, China

Tel: ++86-(0)10-840-39-347

